

Dealing with Wars and Dictatorships

Liora Israël · Guillaume Mouralis
Editors

Dealing with Wars and Dictatorships

Legal Concepts and Categories in Action

In collaboration with Valeria Galimi
and Benn E. Williams



Editors

Liora Israël
Centre Maurice Halbwachs
École des Hautes Études en Sciences
Sociales (EHESS)
Paris
France

Guillaume Mouralis
Institut des sciences sociales du politique
Centre National de la Recherche Scienti-
fique (CNRS)
Nanterre
France

ISBN 978-90-6704-929-0 ISBN 978-90-6704-930-6 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-90-6704-930-6

Library of Congress Control Number: 2013951136

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, and the authors 2014

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

Acknowledgments

The origin of this essay collection can be traced back to the workshop entitled “Transitions, épurations, sorties de guerre. Retour sur les concepts et les catégories d’analyses,” which was held in Paris, May 28–29, 2008, and organized by Valeria Galimi, Liora Israël, and Guillaume Mouralis. Its staging would not have been possible without the generous support of the research group (GDR, CNRS) *Crises extrêmes*, and more certainly Johanna Siméant, the European Network for Contemporary History (EurhistXX, CNRS), the *École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales* (Paris), the *Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique* (France), and the University of Siena (Italy).

The preparation of this collection for publication was made possible by subventions from University Paris Ouest-Nanterre-La Défense (France), the Centre Maurice Halbwachs (ENS/EHESS/CNRS, France), the Institut des Sciences Sociales du Politique (Nanterre/CNRS, France), the European Network for Contemporary History (EurhistXX, CNRS), and the University of Siena. We thank Mark Osiel for steering us to our ever-patient publisher, T.M.C. Asser Press, and we owe special gratitude to Isabelle Delpla, who read the entire manuscript and offered valuable criticisms and comments. Benn Williams has been incredibly supportive and an efficient collaborator.

Liora Israël
Guillaume Mouralis

Contents

1	General Introduction	1
	Liora Israël and Guillaume Mouralis	
 Part I Life and Death of Concepts and Categories		
2	“Épuration”: History of a Word	23
	Alya Aglan and Emmanuelle Loyer	
3	Humanity Seized by International Criminal Justice	39
	Sara Liwerant	
4	Dealing with Collaboration in Belgium After the Second World War: From Activism to Collaboration and Incivism	59
	Dirk Luyten	
5	Transitional Justice as Universal Narrative	77
	Jon Elster	
6	The Invention of “Transitional Justice” in the 1990s	83
	Guillaume Mouralis	
 Part II Implementation of Categories and Savoir-faire		
7	“Transitional Justice” and National “Mastering of the Past”: Criminal Justice and Liberalization Processes in West Germany After 1945	103
	Annette Weinke	
8	Poor Little Belgium? Belgian Trials of German War Criminals, 1944–1951	123
	Pieter Lagrou	

9	From Revolution to Restoration. Transnational Implications of the Greek Purge of Wartime Collaborators	145
	Dimitris Kousouris	
10	The Defense in the Dock: Professional Purges of French Lawyers After the Second World War.	163
	Liora Israël	
Part III Transnational Circulation and Hybridization of Categories		
11	Law and the Soviet Purge: Domestic Renewal and International Convergences	179
	Vanessa Voisin	
12	Circulation of Models of Épuration After the Second World War: From France to Italy	197
	Valeria Galimi	
13	Reassessing the Boundaries of Transitional Justice: An Inquiry on Political Transitions, Armed Conflicts, and Human Rights Violations	209
	David Restrepo Amariles	
14	The Emergence of Transitional Justice as a Professional International Practice	235
	Sandrine Lefranc and Frédéric Vairel	
15	The Uncertain Place of Purge Within Transitional Justice, and the Limitations of International Law in the World’s Response to Mass Atrocity	253
	Mark Osiel	

Contributors

Alya Aglan is Professeure des Universités at the University of Paris 1-Panthéon Sorbonne research unit. Her books include *Le temps de la Résistance* (2008) and *La Résistance sacrifiée: Le mouvement Libération Nord (1940–1947)* (rev. ed. 2006).

Jon Elster is a Norwegian philosopher and sociologist who received his doctorate from the Sorbonne. The author of numerous works, he is the Robert K. Merton Professor of Social Sciences at Columbia University, *professeur titulaire* at the Collège de France, and member of the Norwegian Academy of Science and Letters. His seminal works on transitional justice include *Closing the Books: Transitional Justice in Historical Perspective* (2004) *Retribution and Reparation in the Transition to Democracy* (2006).

Valeria Galimi is an historian and research associate at the Università degli Studi della Tuscia (Viterbo, Italy). Her books include: *Le stragi nazifasciste in Toscana 1943–1945. Guida bibliografica alla memoria* (with Simone Duranti, 2003), *Le XXe siècle des guerres* (co-edited with Pietro Causarano, François Guedj et al., 2004), and *L'antisemitismo in azione: pratiche antiebraiche nella Francia degli anni trenta* (2007).

Liora Israël is a sociologist at the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales and she is assistant director of the Centre Maurice Halbwachs. Winner of the 2008 Prix international Adam Podgórecki, her books include, most notably, *Robes noires, années sombres* (2005), *Michael Pollak: de l'identité blessée à une sociologie des possibles* (co-edited with Danièle Voldman, 2008), and *L'arme du droit* (2009). She recently co-directed, with Rachel Vanneuville, the project “La formation au droit des élites du privé et du public depuis 1958. Quels savoirs juridiques pour quels modes de gouvernement?,” funded by the Agence nationale de la recherche (France).

Dmitris Kousouris is currently the Sawyer Post-Doctoral Fellow in the Franke Institute for Humanities at the University of Chicago. He is the author of “Italia, meta 60 eti: i antistrofes tis mnimis,” *Diplous* (2005); “I ekkatharisi ton ekkathariston 1944–1945: alli mia synithis exairesi,” in *I dekaetia tou 1940: mia epochi rixeon*, ed. Voglis et al. (2012) and the forthcoming *Une épuration ordinaire: procès des collaborateurs en Grèce*.

Pieter Lagrou is professor of contemporary history at the Université Libre de Bruxelles and affiliated with the Institut d'histoire du temps présent (Paris) and

EurHistXX. He is the author of *The Legacy of Nazi Occupation: Patriotic Memory and National Recovery in Western Europe, 1945–1965* (2000), *Europe since 1914. Encyclopedia of the Age of War and Reconstruction*, 5 vols. (with J. Winter, J. Merriman, A. Becker, et al., 2006) and *Viols en temps de guerre* (with R. Branche, F. Virgili, et al., 2011).

Sandrine Lefranc is chargée de recherche CNRS, Institut des Sciences sociales du Politique (ISP), Université de Paris Ouest-Nanterre La Défense. Her books include: *Politiques du pardon* (2002), *Après le conflit, la réconciliation?* (2006), and *Mobilisations de victimes* (with L. Mathieu, 2009).

Sara Liwerant is maître de conférences at the université Paris Ouest Nanterre La Défense and Conseillère of the Minister of Justice and of Human Rights, Republic of the Congo. Her publications include “Mass Murder: Discussing Criminological Perspectives,” *Journal of International Criminal Justice* (2007); *Crimes sans tabou. Les meurtres collectifs en jugement* (2009); and “Voix des violences de guerre et voies d’interprétation: quels échos?” *Criminologie* (2012).

Emmanuelle Loyer is the author (Professeure des universités à Sciences Po Paris), most recently, of *Paris à New York: intellectuels et artistes français en exil, 1940–1947* (2005), *Mai 68 dans le texte* (2008), *Histoire culturelle de la France de la Belle époque à nos jours* (with P. Goetschel, 4th ed., 2011).

Dirk Luyten is a researcher at the Centre for Historical Research and Documentation on War and Contemporary Society in Belgium. He is co-director of the Jushist research project and guest professor at Ghent University. His most recent books include *Justice in Wartime and Revolutions. Europe 1795–1950* (with M. De Koster, H. Leuwers, X. Rousseaux, 2012) and *Hedendaagse economische geschiedenis van België: een inleiding*, (with A. Grauwels, F. Caestecker, P. Scholliers, and E. Vanhaute, 2012).

Guillaume Mouralis is a historian and sociologist at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, and member of the Institut des Sciences sociales du Politique (CNRS and Université Paris Ouest Nanterre). Recent publications include: *Une épuration allemande. La RDA en procès, 1949–2004* (2008), “Lawyers versus jurists. The allied staff at the main Nuremberg Trial,” *Justice in Wartimes and Revolutions* (ed. De Koster and Luyten, 2012), “Introduction” in *Juge à Nuremberg. Souvenirs inédits du procès des criminels Nazis* (ed. Falco, 2012), and “The Rejection of International Criminal Law in West Germany after WWII,” in *History, Memory, and Politics* (ed. Mink and Neumayer, 2013). He is currently working on a social history of the Nuremberg trials.

Mark Osiel is the Aliber Family Chair in Law at the University of Iowa and the author of, most notably, *Mass Atrocity, Collective Memory, and the Law* (1997), *The End of Reciprocity: Terror, Torture, and the Law of War* (2009), *Making Sense of Mass Atrocity* (2009).

David Restrepo Amariles is Assistant Lecturer in Law and Researcher at the Université Libre de Bruxelles. He is also Research Associate to the European

Commission funded project *ATLAS: Armed Conflicts, Peacekeeping and Transitional Justice. Law as a Solution*. He is the author of *Legality and Legitimacy: The Legal and Political Philosophy of Popular Sovereignty in the New Latin American Constitutions* (2010).

Frédéric Vairel is Assistant Professor of Political Studies at the University of Ottawa. His recent publications include: “Des victimes en mouvement. Sociologie d'une controverse publique sur la violence d'Etat au Maroc”, in *Mobilisations de victims* (ed. S. Lefranc and L. Mathieu, 2009), *Social Movements, Mobilization, and Contestation in the Middle East and North Africa* (with Joel Beinin, 2011), and, *Fabrique des elections* (with Florian Kohstall, 2011).

Vanessa Voisin is currently the deputy director of the French-Russian Center of Research in Moscow. Her publications include “Retribute or reintegrate? The Ambiguity of Soviet Policies Towards Repatriates: The Case of Kalinin Province, 1943–1950,” *Jahrbücher für Geschichte Osteuropas* (2007); “The Early Stages of the ‘Legal Purges’ in Soviet Russia (1941–1945),” *Cahiers du monde russe* (with S. Kudriashov, 2008); and “Caught Between War Repressions and Party Purge. The Loyalty of Kalinin Party Members Put to the Test of the Second World War,” *Cahiers du monde russe* (2011).

Annette Weinke is an assistant researcher in the Department of Modern and Contemporary History at the Friedrich Schiller Universität Jena. Her works include *Die Nürnberger Prozesse* (2006), *Eine Gesellschaft ermittelt gegen sich selbst. Die Geschichte der Zentralen Stelle Ludwigsburg 1958–2008* (2008), and “War Crimes, Genocide Trials and Vergangenheitspolitik—the German Case,” *The Genocide Convention Sixty Years after its Adoption* (ed. Safferling and Conze, 2010).

Benn Williams is a historian and freelance translator based at the University of Illinois at Chicago. His publications include *Re-examining the Holocaust through Literature* (with A. Kluge, 2009) and “Dénoncer les délateurs. L'épuration dans le Rhône, 1944–1953” in *La délation dans la France des années noires* (ed. L. Joly, 2013).