

Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

Volume 44

For further volumes:
<http://www.springer.com/series/8913>

Mielle K. Bulterman · Willem J.M. van Genugten
Volume Editors

Netherlands Yearbook of International Law 2013

Crisis and International Law:
Decoy or Catalyst?



ASSER PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Springer

Volume Editors

Mielle K. Bulterman
Legal Affairs Department
Ministry of Foreign Affairs
The Hague
The Netherlands

Willem J.M. van Genugten
Tilburg Law School
University of Tilburg
Tilburg
The Netherlands

ISSN 0167-6768

ISBN 978-94-6265-010-7

DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-011-4

ISSN 1574-0951 (electronic)

ISBN 978-94-6265-011-4 (eBook)

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2014

Library of Congress Control Number: 72-623109

This Volume is also available as a journal product, either as part of the subscription to Volume 60 of the Netherlands International Law Review, or as a stand-alone journal, both through Cambridge University Press. In addition to the electronic version published on <http://www.springerlink>, the Yearbook is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service.

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

Board of Editors

Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

F. Amtenbrink
Erasmus University Rotterdam

J.E. Nijman
University of Amsterdam

M.K. Bulterman
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

W.G. Werner
VU University, Amsterdam

W.J.M. van Genugten
(General Editor)
Tilburg University

R.A. Wessel
(General Editor)
University of Twente

H.G. van der Wilt
University of Amsterdam

Managing Editor

M. Ambrus
Faculty of Law
University of Groningen
Oude Kijk in 't Jatstraat 26
9712 EK Groningen
The Netherlands

Aims and Scope

The Netherlands Yearbook of International Law (NYIL) was first published in 1970. It offers a forum for the publication of scholarly articles in the area of public international law including the law of the European Union. In addition, each Yearbook includes a section *Dutch Practice in International Law*. The NYIL is published under the auspices of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut.

T.M.C. Asser Instituut

Located in the ‘international zone’ of The Hague—the City of Justice, Peace and Security, The T.M.C. Asser Instituut is a leading, inter-university research institute operating in the broad field of international law.

Founded in 1965, the Institute’s international community of scholars is engaged in research, postgraduate training and dissemination of knowledge in furtherance of the purposes and principles of international law. This inter-university institute cooperates closely with and supports the Dutch universities’ activities in the relevant disciplines. The academic fields covered by the Institute are Private International Law, Public International Law, Law of the European Union, International Commercial Arbitration, International Humanitarian Law, International Criminal Law and International Sports Law.

The Institute enjoys an excellent reputation at national and international level for its development, organisation and hosting of conferences and academic meetings, demand-driven postgraduate programmes and training. Its ancillary websites and data collections all contribute to a coherent and integral strategy in the area of knowledge transfer.

The Institute has its own publishing house, T.M.C. Asser Press. The T.M.C. Asser Press not only serves the publishing needs of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut, but also those of academics and practitioners worldwide in the fields of International and European Law.

T.M.C. Asser Instituut

Institute for Private and Public International Law

International Commercial Arbitration and European Law

Institute Address:

R.J. Schimmelpennincklaan 20–22

2517 JN, The Hague

The Netherlands

Mailing Address:

P.O. Box 30461

2500 GL The Hague

The Netherlands

Tel.: +3170 342 0300

Fax: +3170 342 0359

Email: NYIL@asser.nl

Internet: www.asser.nl

Contents

Part I Crisis and International Law: Decoy or Catalyst?

1 Crises: Concern and Fuel for International Law and International Lawyers	3
Willem van Genugten and Mielle Bulterman	
1.1 Introduction	4
1.2 Overview of the Chapters	5
1.3 Highlighting Issues of General Concern and Interest.	10
1.3.1 The Role of Crises in Developing International Law	10
1.3.2 Do We Do the Things Right or Do We Do the Right Things?.	13
1.3.3 Reconsidering and Sharpening Compliance	14
1.3.4 The Role of International Lawyers	17
References	18
2 The Crisis and the Quotidian in International Human Rights Law	19
Benjamin Authers and Hilary Charlesworth	
2.1 Introduction	20
2.2 What is a Crisis?	21
2.3 The Crises of International Human Rights Law	24
2.3.1 Crisis as Catalyst	25
2.3.2 Crisis as Distraction	28
2.4 A Crisis-Driven Distinction Between Rights	30
2.5 Conclusion.	37
References	38
3 The Crisis of International Human Rights Law in the Global Market Economy	41
Daniel Augenstein	
3.1 Human Rights and Business.	42
3.2 The International Legal Order of States and the Challenge of Corporate Power.	44

3.3	Bhopal	48
3.4	The 'Escape' into Tort	51
3.5	The Turn to Governance	55
3.6	International Human Rights Law at the Crossroads.	59
	References	63
4	International Refugees and Irregular Migrants: Caught in the Mundane Shadow of Crisis	65
	Juan M. Amaya-Castro	
4.1	Introduction: The Crisis-Mundane Distinction	66
4.2	The Refugee Crisis: The Legal Limbo of the Refugee and the Normalization of the Camp	69
4.2.1	Refugee Law: A Discipline of Crisis, a Discipline in Crisis	69
4.2.2	The Temporary Nature of the Refugee	71
4.3	Irregular Migration: Cracking the Black Box of Sovereignty	77
4.4	Beyond the Crisis/Mundane Distinction?	84
	References	86
5	Saving Humanity from Hell: International Criminal Law and Permanent Crisis	89
	Edwin Bikundo	
5.1	Between Utopia and Dystopia	90
5.2	International Criminal Law: A Discipline of and for Crisis	92
5.3	Getting to and from 'twas never thus' to 'twas ever thus'	97
5.4	UNSC as a Force Arresting Catastrophe	101
5.5	Conclusion: Real Versus Official Crises	107
	References	108
6	Warming to Crisis: The Climate Change Law of Unintended Opportunity	111
	Tomer Broude	
6.1	Introduction	112
6.2	Crisis? What Crisis?	113
6.2.1	Reflecting on Crisis and its Models	113
6.2.2	Climate Change: A Different Kind of Crisis?	115
6.2.3	Crisis, Failure and the Birth of the New	117
6.3	The Construction of Climate Crisis Framing and its Rhetoric	118
6.3.1	The Roots of Climate Crisis Framing	118
6.3.2	Climate Crisis Framing in Negotiations.	119
6.3.3	Climate Crisis Framing in Academia and Civil Society	121
6.3.4	Climate Crisis Framing and Lawyers	122

6.4	The ‘Technical Limitations’ of Climate Crisis Framing.	123
6.4.1	International Lawyers and the Scientific Debate.	123
6.4.2	Analytic Progress Despite Crisis Framing: The Micro and Macro	125
6.4.3	Thickness, Depth and the Overreach of Crisis Framing	126
6.5	The ‘Ethical Limitations’ of Climate Crisis Framing.	128
6.5.1	An Increasingly Broad, Not Narrow, Climate Agenda for International Law	128
6.5.2	Which ‘Heroic Mission’? What Silences?	131
6.5.3	The Unrestricted Substance of International Climate Change Law: From Multilateralism to Multilevel Engagement	132
6.6	Conclusion: Crisis and the Opportunities of International Law	134
	References	136
7	Between Crisis and Complacency: Seeking Commitment in International Environmental Law	139
	Karin Mickelson	
7.1	Introduction	140
7.2	Crisis in International Environmental Law and Policy.	141
7.2.1	The Use (and Abuse) of Crisis in Environmentalism.	141
7.2.2	Differing Perspectives on Environmental Crisis	143
7.2.3	From Crisis to Sustainability	146
7.3	Crisis and Specific International Environmental Regimes	148
7.3.1	The Case of Ozone.	148
7.3.2	The Contrast with Climate Change and Other Environmental Problems	149
7.3.3	Accounting for the Difference: Downs and the Issue Attention Cycle	153
7.4	Crisis and Commitment.	155
	References	158
8	The WTO and the Doha Negotiation in Crisis?	161
	Alexia Herwig	
8.1	Introduction	162
8.2	The Notion of Crisis.	163
8.3	The WTO in Crisis?	165
8.3.1	Development of the Doha Negotiations.	165
8.3.2	The WTO in a Legitimacy Crisis?	167
8.3.3	The DDA Negotiations as the Locus of a Legitimacy Crisis?	170

8.4	Consequences of a Perceived Legitimacy Crisis for the Development of Multilateral Trade Liberalisation Law	178
8.5	Conclusion: How to Avert a Crisis?	182
	References	184
9	The EU in Crisis: Crisis Discourse as a Technique of Government	187
	Jessica C. Lawrence	
9.1	Introduction	188
9.2	Crisis as a Technique of Government	190
9.3	The Unexceptional Crisis.	193
9.4	Crisis and the Production of Truth	195
9.5	The Uncertain Effects of Crisis	197
9.6	Conclusion: Crisis Discourse as a Technique of EU Government	201
	References	201
 Part II Dutch Practice in International Law		
10	The Thin Line Between Deference and Indifference: The Supreme Court of The Netherlands and the Iranian Sanctions Case	205
	Marjolein Busstra	
10.1	Introduction	206
10.2	The European Debate: <i>Kadi</i> Versus <i>Nada</i>	207
	10.2.1 The <i>Kadi</i> -Approach of the ECJ: Moderated Dualism.	207
	10.2.2 The <i>Nada</i> -Approach of the ECtHR: Moderated Monism.	210
10.3	<i>Kadi</i> and <i>Nada</i> Merged: Position of the Supreme Court of The Netherlands	212
10.4	The Supreme Court of The Netherlands as Subsidiary of the European Courts?	216
	References	219
	Table of Cases.	221
	Index	225