

Status of Forces: Criminal Jurisdiction over Military Personnel Abroad

Joop Voetelink

Status of Forces: Criminal Jurisdiction over Military Personnel Abroad



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Joop Voetelink
Faculty of Military Science
Netherlands Defence Academy
Breda
The Netherlands

Translated by Marielle Matthee

ISBN 978-94-6265-056-5 ISBN 978-94-6265-057-2 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-057-2

Library of Congress Control Number: 2015931533

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2015

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer Science+Business Media B.V. Dordrecht is part of Springer Science+Business Media
(www.springer.com)

Contents

| | | |
|----------|--|----|
| 1 | Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 | An Example: Afghanistan, 2001–2014 | 2 |
| 1.2 | Status of Forces | 3 |
| 1.2.1 | Status of Forces vis-à-vis Military Operations and International Military Cooperation | 3 |
| 1.2.2 | Criminal Jurisdiction and Immunity | 4 |
| 1.3 | Structure | 5 |
| 1.3.1 | General | 5 |
| 1.3.2 | Part I: Historical Analysis. | 6 |
| 1.3.3 | Part II: International Law Perspective | 7 |
| 1.3.4 | Part III: Military Operational Law Perspective | 8 |
| 1.4 | Terminology | 9 |
| 1.4.1 | Consent. | 9 |
| 1.4.2 | Internal Order and Discipline | 11 |
| 1.4.3 | Crisis Management Operations | 11 |
| 1.4.4 | Jurisdiction and Immunity | 12 |
| 1.4.5 | SOFAs | 16 |
| 1.4.6 | Definition | 17 |
| | References | 17 |

Part I Historical Analysis

| | | |
|----------|---|----|
| 2 | The Ground Rule | 23 |
| 2.1 | Introduction | 23 |
| 2.2 | The Exchange v. McFaddon | 24 |
| 2.3 | Coleman v. Tennessee and Dow v. Johnson | 25 |
| 2.4 | The Ground Rule | 27 |
| 2.5 | Nineteenth Century Practice. | 28 |

| | | |
|----------|---|-----------|
| 2.6 | The Scope of Criminal Jurisdiction | 30 |
| 2.7 | Conclusion | 32 |
| | References | 33 |
| 3 | Foreign Armed Forces on Allied Territory During Armed Conflict . . . | 35 |
| 3.1 | Introduction | 35 |
| 3.2 | World War I Practice | 36 |
| | 3.2.1 Allied Powers | 36 |
| | 3.2.2 Central Powers | 38 |
| 3.3 | World War II Practice | 39 |
| 3.4 | Post World War II Practice | 45 |
| 3.5 | Analysing International Practice | 47 |
| 3.6 | Conclusion | 50 |
| | Annex A | 51 |
| | References | 52 |
| 4 | Armed Forces Participating in Crisis Management Operations | 55 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 55 |
| 4.2 | League of Nations | 56 |
| 4.3 | UN | 57 |
| | 4.3.1 Experts on Mission | 58 |
| | 4.3.2 Troops | 60 |
| 4.4 | Other Organisations and Coalitions | 64 |
| | 4.4.1 General | 64 |
| | 4.4.2 NATO | 66 |
| | 4.4.3 EU | 70 |
| | 4.4.4 Coalitions of States | 73 |
| 4.5 | Stationing in and Transit Through Third States | 76 |
| 4.6 | Disaster Relief | 77 |
| 4.7 | Analysis of Crisis Management Practice | 79 |
| 4.8 | Conclusion | 81 |
| | References | 82 |
| 5 | Military Cooperation | 85 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 85 |
| 5.2 | The Cold War | 87 |
| | 5.2.1 The Aftermath of World War II | 87 |
| | 5.2.2 NATO | 90 |
| | 5.2.3 Bilateral Cooperation Outside the Context of NATO . . . | 95 |
| | 5.2.4 Eastern Europe | 97 |
| 5.3 | After the Cold War | 98 |
| | 5.3.1 Partnership for Peace, the Extension of NATO and EU . . . | 99 |
| | 5.3.2 The Security Situation After 11 September 2001 | 102 |
| 5.4 | Analysis | 106 |
| 5.5 | Conclusion | 109 |
| | References | 110 |

Part II The International Law Perspective

6 The Sovereign State and the Exercise of Jurisdiction 115

6.1 Introduction 115

6.2 The Origin and Development of the Concept of State 116

6.3 The Sovereign State 117

6.4 Jurisdiction of a State 119

6.4.1 Jurisdiction 119

6.4.2 Principles of Jurisdiction 120

6.5 Conclusion 123

References 124

7 Immunity 125

7.1 Introduction 125

7.2 State Immunity 126

7.2.1 General Overview 127

7.2.2 Absolute Doctrine of State Immunity 127

7.2.3 Restrictive Doctrine of State Immunity 128

7.2.4 Codification 130

7.3 Immunity of State Officials 131

7.3.1 Functional and Personal Immunity 132

7.3.2 State Officials 135

7.3.3 International Crimes and Immunity 141

7.4 Conclusion 146

References 146

8 The State, the Armed Forces and the Concept of Immunity 149

8.1 Introduction 149

8.2 The State, the Armed Forces and Jurisdiction 150

8.2.1 Relationship Between the State and Its Armed Force 151

8.2.2 Criminal Jurisdiction and the Armed Forces 154

8.3 Armed Forces and the Concept of Immunity 155

8.3.1 Position of the Armed Forces Under the Absolute and Restrictive Doctrine of State Immunity 156

8.3.2 Armed Forces and the Concept of Functional Immunity 158

8.3.3 Warships 162

8.3.4 Military Aircraft 163

8.4 Conclusion 165

References 166

9 International Organisations 169

9.1 Introduction 170

9.2 Definition of International Organisations 171

| | | |
|-------|--|-----|
| 9.3 | Establishment of International Organisations and Their Legal Personality | 172 |
| 9.4 | UN, NATO and EU | 174 |
| 9.4.1 | UN | 174 |
| 9.4.2 | NATO | 175 |
| 9.4.3 | EU | 177 |
| 9.5 | The Status of International Organisations | 178 |
| 9.5.1 | Organisation | 178 |
| 9.5.2 | Staff | 179 |
| 9.5.3 | National Representatives | 181 |
| 9.6 | Immunities of Armed Forces Seconded to International Organisations | 181 |
| 9.6.1 | The Staff | 182 |
| 9.6.2 | International Forces | 183 |
| 9.7 | Conclusion | 186 |
| | References | 186 |

Part III Military Operational Law

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 10 | Law of Visiting Forces as Part of Military Operational Law | 191 |
| 10.1 | Introduction | 191 |
| 10.2 | Military Law and Military Operational Law | 192 |
| 10.2.1 | A Description of Military Operational Law | 193 |
| 10.2.2 | Historical Development of Military Operational Law | 194 |
| 10.3 | Law of Visiting Forces Within the Context of Military Operational Law | 195 |
| 10.3.1 | The Legal Basis for the Visiting Forces | 196 |
| 10.3.2 | The SOFA | 197 |
| 10.4 | Conclusion | 201 |
| | References | 201 |
| 11 | Terminology | 203 |
| 11.1 | Introduction | 203 |
| 11.2 | In Performance of Official Duty | 204 |
| 11.2.1 | The Scope of 'on Duty' | 205 |
| 11.2.2 | Competence to Determine Application of the Term 'on Duty' | 207 |
| 11.3 | Command and Control | 209 |
| 11.4 | Conclusion | 211 |
| | References | 212 |

12 Analysis of the Frameworks for Foreign Presence from an International Operational Perspective 213

12.1 Introduction 213

12.2 The Protective Function of SOFAs. 214

12.3 The Different Frameworks for Extraterritorial Presence 217

 12.3.1 Support During Armed Conflict 219

 12.3.2 Crisis Management Operations 221

 12.3.3 International Military Cooperation. 224

12.4 Misconduct During UN Crisis Management Operations 225

12.5 Conclusion 229

References 231

13 Specific SOFA Provisions 233

13.1 Introduction 233

13.2 Respect for Local Law 234

13.3 Use of Force 237

 13.3.1 SOFA 237

 13.3.2 Rules of Engagement 238

 13.3.3 Right to Self-defence 239

13.4 Claims. 240

13.5 Conclusion 243

References 244

Part IV Synthesis and Conclusion

14 Synthesis and Conclusion 249

14.1 Introduction 249

14.2 The Theory 250

 14.2.1 The Exchange v. McFaddon as Basis 250

 14.2.2 Functional Immunity of State Officials 252

 14.2.3 The Instrumental Role of SOFAs 252

 14.2.4 Status of Forces in Three Frameworks 253

14.3 Proposal for a Status-of-Forces Compendium 258

 14.3.1 Future Foreign Presence of Forces 258

 14.3.2 Reducing the Burden 259

 14.3.3 Status-of-Forces Compendium. 260

14.4 Conclusion 263

References 265

Index 267

Abbreviations

| | |
|-----------|---|
| AAP | Allied Administrative Publication |
| ACT | Allied Command Transformation |
| ADCON | Administrative Control |
| ADMCON | Administrative Control |
| AJIL | American Journal of International Law |
| AMIB | Inter-African Mission to Monitor the Bangui Agreements |
| AMIS | African Mission in Sudan |
| AMISOM | African Union Mission to Somalia |
| ATS | Australian Treaty Series |
| AU | African Union |
| BGBI | Bundesgesetzblatt |
| CAEMC | Central African Economic and Monetary Community |
| CAR | Central African Republic |
| CFSP | Common Foreign and Security Policy |
| CIS | Commonwealth of Independent States |
| CMF | Commonwealth Monitoring Force |
| CPA | Coalition Provisional Authority |
| CSDP | Common Security and Defence Policy |
| CSTO | Collective Security Treaty Organization |
| DRC | Democratic Republic of the Congo |
| EADRU | Euro-Atlantic Disaster Response Unit |
| EAG | European Air Group |
| EAS | Executive Agreements Series |
| EASBRICOM | Eastern Africa Standby Brigade Coordination Mechanism |
| EC | European Community |
| ECCAS | Economic Community of Central African States |
| ECOWAS | Economic Community of West African States |
| ECtHR | European Court of Human Rights |
| EDC | European Defense Community |
| EEAW | European Participating Air Forces' Expeditionary Air Wing |
| EGF | European Gendarmerie Force |

| | |
|----------|--|
| EJIL | European Journal of International Law |
| EU | European Union |
| EUF | European Union Force |
| EUFOR | European Union Force |
| EUMM | European Union Monitoring Mission |
| FOMUC | Multinational Force Central African Republic |
| FRG | Republic of Germany |
| FRONTEX | European Agency for the Management of Operational Cooperation at the External Borders of the Member States of the European Union |
| FSIA | Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act |
| FULLCOM | Full Command |
| GDR | German Democratic Republic |
| HQ | Headquarters |
| HQ ACT | Headquarters Allied Command Transformation |
| ICJ | International Court of Justice |
| ICTY | International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia |
| IFOR | Implementation Force |
| IGO | International Governmental Organisations |
| ILC | International Law Commission |
| ILDC | International Law in Domestic Courts |
| ILR | International Law Reports |
| INTERFET | International Force in East Timor |
| IPKF | Indian Peacekeeping Force |
| IPMT | International Peace Monitoring Team |
| ISAF | International Security Assistance Force |
| ISF | International Stabilization Force |
| JFC | Joint Force Command |
| JMBI | Justizministerialblatt |
| KAV | Kavass Series |
| KFOR | Kosovo Force |
| LNOJ | League of Nations Official Journal |
| LNTS | League of Nations Treaty Series |
| MAAG | Military Assistance Advisory Group |
| MCDA | Military and Civil Defence Assets |
| MFO | Multinational Force and Observers |
| MICOPAX | Mission for the Consolidation of Peace |
| MIF | Multinational Interim Force |
| MinBl | Ministerialblatt |
| MINURCA | UN Mission in the Central African Republic |
| MINURCAT | UN Mission in the Central African Republic and Chad |
| MINUSMA | UN Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali |
| MINUSTAH | UN Stabilization Mission in Haiti |
| MNF | Multinational Force |
| MNF-I | Multinational Force Iraq |

| | |
|----------|---|
| MONUC | Mission de l'Organisation des Nations Unies en République Démocratique du Congo |
| MOPEP | Military Observer Mission Ecuador-Peru |
| MOU | Memorandum of Understanding |
| MStGB | Militärstrafgesetzbuch |
| MTA | Military Technical Agreement |
| NA5CRO | Non-Article 5 Crisis Response Operations |
| NATO | North Atlantic Treaty Organization |
| NC3A | NATO Consultation, Command and Control Agency |
| NGO | Non-governmental Organisation |
| NTM-I | NATO Training Mission Iraq |
| OAS | Organization of American States |
| OAU | Organisation of African Unity |
| OCHA | Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs |
| OECS | Organization of Eastern Caribbean States |
| OEF | Operation Enduring Freedom |
| OJ | Official Journal of the European Union |
| OLA | Office of Legal Affairs |
| ONUC | UN Mission in the Congo |
| OPCOM | Operational Command |
| OPCON | Operational Control |
| OSCE | Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe |
| PCA | Permanent Court of Arbitration |
| PCIJ | Permanent Court of International Justice |
| PfP | Partnership for Peace |
| PITSE | Pacific Islands Treaty Series |
| PSC | Peace and Security Council |
| RAMSI | Regional Assistance Mission to Solomon Islands |
| ROE | Rules of Engagement |
| RSS | Regional Security System |
| SADC | Southern African Development Community |
| SBA | Sovereign Base Areas |
| SCO | Shanghai Cooperation Organisation |
| SFOR | Stabilization Force |
| SHAPE | Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers in Europe |
| Shirbrig | Stand-By Forces High Readiness Brigade |
| SIA | State Immunity Act |
| SOFA | Status of Forces Agreement |
| SOMA | Status of Mission Agreement |
| SPPKF | South Pacific Peacekeeping Force |
| SSD | Security Sector Development |
| SSR | Security Sector Reform |
| SU | Soviet Union |
| TACOM | Tactical Command |
| TACON | Tactical Control |

| | |
|----------|--|
| TEU | Treaty on European Union |
| TIAS | Treaties and other International Acts Series |
| TMG | Truce Monitoring Group for Bougainville |
| TOA | Transfer of Authority |
| TTP | Tactics, Techniques and Procedures |
| UAE | United Arab Emirates |
| UK | United Kingdom |
| UKTS | United Kingdom Treaty Series |
| UNAMSIL | UN Assistance Mission in Sierra Leone |
| UNCLOS | UN Convention on the Law of the Sea |
| UNDOF | UN Disengagement Observer Force |
| UNEF | UN Emergency Force |
| UNIFIL | UN Interim Force in Lebanon |
| UNIIMOG | United Nations Iran–Iraq Military Observer Group |
| UNITAF | United Task Force |
| UNMEE | UN Mission in Ethiopia and Eritrea |
| UNMIL | UN Mission in Liberia |
| UNMIS | UN Mission in the Sudan |
| UNMIT | UN Integrated Mission in Timor-Leste |
| UNOSOM | UN Operation in Somalia |
| UNPROFOR | UN Protection Force |
| UNSC | United Nations Security Council |
| UNSCOB | UN Special Committee on the Balkans |
| UNTAET | UN Transitional Administration in East Timor |
| UNTAG | UN Transition Assistance Group |
| UNTS | UN Treaty Series |
| UNTSO | UN Truce Supervision Organization |
| US | United States |