

Frontiers of Equality in the Development of EU and US Citizenship

Jeremy B. Bierbach

Frontiers of Equality in the Development of EU and US Citizenship



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Jeremy B. Bierbach
Franssen Advocaten
Amsterdam
The Netherlands

ISBN 978-94-6265-164-7 ISBN 978-94-6265-165-4 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-165-4

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016956828

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2017

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer Science+Business Media B.V.
The registered company address is: Van Godewijkstraat 30, 3311 GX Dordrecht, The Netherlands

Acknowledgments

This book is based on my doctoral thesis in European constitutional law, which I publicly defended at the University of Amsterdam on 2 September 2015. As such, most of my acknowledgments for this book are due to everyone who helped me to successfully make it to that point.

First, thanks are due to my supervisors at the faculty of law at the University of Amsterdam, Tom Eijsbouts, Jan-Herman Reestman, and Annette Schrauwen. I worked with Tom and Jan-Herman as an editor at the *European Constitutional Law Review*, and they convinced me to pursue this research, having noticed my interest in the ways that EU citizenship influences the legal practice of immigration law. And Annette gave me (and still gives me) the opportunity to lecture her master's students of law on the Citizenship Directive of EU law (Directive 2004/38) every year, providing me with the teaching experience that is essential to the Latin meaning of *doctor*.

Since I was an external doctoral candidate, my research and writing processes were relatively secluded. So it was nice to be able to have the opportunity to air my ideas and receive feedback on them. The informal meetings at the Center for Migration Law at the Radboud University Nijmegen provided me with such a sounding board. Thanks to Karin Zwaan, Ricky van Oers, Kees Groenendijk, Elspeth Guild, and Tineke Strik. Thanks are due as well to Sébastien Chauvin for inviting me to give a guest lecture to his students in the Department of Sociology at the University of Amsterdam every year: an experience which helped me greatly in presenting my ideas to a non-legal audience.

For my research on American constitutional law, I had virtually no formal educational background. Bob Bastress, Professor of Constitutional Law at the University of West Virginia, was my long-distance teacher, first pointing me to the literature in the established curriculum on US constitutional law. He also thoroughly reviewed my work in that area, saving me from certain embarrassment if some of the mistakes I had made from misreading Supreme Court judgments on a computer screen late at night—mistakes my supervisors probably wouldn't have caught—had remained in my final text.

I had the honor to defend my thesis (with the unwavering support of my par-nymphs Consuelo Ramirez and Wijbrand Stet) against the challenging opposition provided by Profs. Gareth Davies, Betty de Hart, Ulli d'Oliveira, Ernst Hirsch Ballin, Ruud Janssens, and Christoph Schönberger. I have incorporated into this book many of my responses to the points they raised. Special thanks are due to Ernst Hirsch Ballin for recommending my book for publication by T.M.C. Asser Press, as well as to Janne Nijman, also of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut. At T.M.C. Asser Press, publisher Frank Bakker, Kiki van Gulp, and Antoinette Wessels helped me to finalize my manuscript.

On a personal note, thanks are due to my parents, Jane Offutt and Charles A. Bierbach, for being role models in using their intellect to help others. And last but not least: Stefan, I couldn't do it without your love and vital support.

Contents

1	<i>Civis Duplex Sum: Two Layers of Citizenship in a Dialogue of Equality</i>	1
1.1	From Subject to Citizen	2
1.2	Duplex Citizenship	4
1.3	Justification of the Cases Selected	6
1.4	Road Map	7
1.5	Note for the Reader	10
1.6	Appendix 1: Terminology	10
1.6.1	Federal, Horizontal Versus Vertical, State Versus State	10
1.7	Appendix 2: Types of Equality	12
1.7.1	Uniform Equality	12
1.7.2	Non-discrimination	13
1.7.3	Cross-Border Equality	13
1.7.4	Portability	13
	References	13
 Part I The Development of United States Citizenship		
2	Subjecthood in England and the British Empire	17
2.1	Introduction	18
2.2	Calvin’s Case	19
2.3	The Glorious Revolution	29
2.4	Subjecthood in the North American Dominions	41
2.4.1	Immigration and Naturalization in England	42
2.4.2	The Constitutional Position of the Colonies	48
2.4.3	Naturalization in the Colonies	53
2.5	Conclusion: The Declaration of Independence as the Point of Departure of the American Constitution from the British Constitution	57
	References	64

3	From Revolution to Constitution to Civil War: US Citizenship in Its Youth	67
3.1	Introduction	68
3.2	Independence: The Watershed Moment	69
3.2.1	Subjecthood and Citizenship: Revolutionary Doctrine	70
3.3	The Postwar Years: Tying Up Loose Ends	78
3.4	The Further Articulation of Citizenship: Immigration and Naturalization	81
3.5	Citizenship Under the Articles of Confederation and the Constitution	83
3.6	The Naturalization Act of 1790	96
3.7	The Naturalization Acts of 1795, 1798, and 1800	99
3.8	Conclusion: Immigration and Naturalization.	106
	References	107
4	Horizontal Conflict in United States Citizenship Before the Civil War	109
4.1	Introduction	110
4.2	Slavery and the Constitution: Three Provisions	112
4.2.1	The Apportionment Clause	113
4.2.2	The Slave-Trade Clause	116
4.2.3	The Fugitive Slave Clause	116
4.3	Equality and the Constitution: Four Forms	120
4.3.1	Excursion: Federal Citizenship and Allegiance	129
4.4	Equality at the Point of Collision with Slavery	130
4.4.1	Horizontal Norms Regarding Slavery: Comity and the Full Faith and Credit Clause	131
4.4.2	Vertical Norms Regarding Slavery: The Northwest Ordinance and the Fugitive Slave Clause.	134
4.4.3	The Schism Widens Between the States: <i>Prigg v. Pennsylvania</i>	139
4.4.4	Slavery and Territorial Expansion: <i>Dred Scott v. Sandford</i>	143
4.5	Conclusion: The Failure of Horizontal United States Citizenship	148
	References	151
5	A New, Vertical Beginning for United States Citizenship	153
5.1	Introduction	154
5.2	The Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments	154
5.2.1	The Formal Introduction of a Vertical United States Citizenship and Human Rights Standard	161
5.3	The Long Road to Substantive Equality Based on US Citizenship	162
5.3.1	The Tilden-Hayes Compromise: The Political Abrogation of the Reconstruction Amendments	163

- 5.3.2 *The Slaughterhouse Cases* and *Plessy v. Ferguson*:
The Judicial Abrogation of the Reconstruction
Amendments 164
- 5.3.3 *Wong Kim Ark*: The Cinching of Birthright
US Citizenship 171
- 5.4 The Only Way is Up: Toward the Full Development
of Civil Rights 176
 - 5.4.1 *Edwards v. California* and *Mitchell v. United States* 177
 - 5.4.2 *Brown v. Board of Education*: Effectively Instituting
a Uniform Equality. 182
 - 5.4.3 Legislating Uniform Electoral Equality
and Cross-Border Equality. 184
 - 5.4.4 A revival of the Privileges or Immunities Clause?. 189
- 5.5 Conclusion: United States Citizenship as a Vertical Norm 191
- References. 196

Part II The Development of European Union Citizenship

- 6 European Integration as a Project of the Member States 199**
 - 6.1 Introduction 200
 - 6.2 The Postwar European Idea, Leading up to the European
Coal and Steel Community 202
 - 6.2.1 The “Hague” Line 206
 - 6.2.2 The “Westminster” Line. 211
 - 6.2.3 The First Community: The ECSC 213
 - 6.3 The European Economic Community: The Early Years
Leading up to the Emergence of the Citizen 217
 - 6.3.1 From the Worker to the Citizen: Political
Developments. 224
 - 6.3.2 European Citizenship via Freedom of Movement:
Racial Criteria?. 230
 - 6.3.3 Freedom of Movement: Forms of Equality 241
 - References. 244
- 7 The *De Facto* Community Citizen Emerges 247**
 - 7.1 The European Court of Justice Confirms “An Incipient
Form of Citizenship” 248
 - 7.1.1 The “Big Bang” of the Community Legal Order:
Van Gend & Loos and *Costa v. ENEL* 252
 - 7.1.2 The First Community Citizen: Unger 255
 - 7.2 Excursion: British Citizenship, Allegiance, and the
Community. 263
 - 7.2.1 British Citizenship, Commonwealth Citizenship,
and Decolonization. 271
 - 7.2.2 British Citizenship *avant la lettre*, Toward Membership
in the Community. 278

7.3	<i>Levin</i> : Further Defining the Worker	285
7.3.1	“Reverse Discrimination”: <i>Morson and Jhanjan</i>	290
7.3.2	Bringing Cross-Border Equality Back Home	292
	References.	298
8	The Maastricht Treaty Introduces European Union	
	Citizenship <i>De Jure</i>	301
8.1	Moving Toward Formal Citizenship.	302
8.1.1	<i>Gravier</i> and the Constitutional Struggle to Establish a Vertical Citizenship Through Equality	307
8.2	The Treaty of Maastricht, the Foundation of the European Union and the Formal Introduction of Union Citizenship	316
8.2.1	The Spanish Contribution to Union Citizenship	318
8.3	Rights of Movement and Residence in Union Citizenship: The First Decade	321
8.3.1	<i>Konstantinidis</i>	323
8.3.2	<i>Martínez Sala</i>	324
8.3.3	<i>Bickel and Franz</i>	325
8.3.4	<i>Grzelczyk</i>	326
8.3.5	<i>Baumbast and R</i> : A “Layer Cake” of Cross-Border Equality	329
8.3.6	<i>Garcia Avello</i> and the Portability of Rights	338
	References.	344
9	The Union Legislature Elaborates on Union Citizenship; the Court Responds.	347
9.1	Directive 2004/38: The Consolidation in the Secondary Legislation of the Rights of Residence Based on Union Citizenship	348
9.1.1	The Substance of the Directive	348
9.1.2	The Legislative Process Behind the Directive: The Addition of Non-traditional Partnerships	351
9.2	Interlude from the Court: <i>Zhu and Chen</i>	358
9.3	Second-Class Union Citizenship?	361
9.3.1	Formally Second-Class Union Citizens: Citizens of Accession States.	362
9.3.2	Substantively Second-Class Union Citizens: Sedentary Union Citizens.	364
9.3.3	<i>Carpenter</i>	369
9.3.4	<i>Eind</i>	370
9.3.5	<i>Metock et al.</i>	374
9.3.6	Reverberations in the Member States on the Use of Mobility by “Second-Class Union Citizens”.	378
9.3.7	<i>Chakroun</i>	381

9.4	<i>Rottmann</i> and <i>Ruiz Zambrano</i> : Union Citizenship Gains an Additional Vertical Dimension and Starts to Breach the “Purely Internal” Situation	383
9.4.1	Background: <i>Micheletti</i> and <i>Kaur</i>	383
9.4.2	<i>Rottmann</i>	393
9.4.3	<i>Ruiz Zambrano</i>	399
9.4.4	<i>Shirley McCarthy</i>	403
9.4.5	<i>Dereci, Iida, O and S and L, Alokpa</i>	406
	References	411
10	<i>O & B</i> and <i>S & G</i>: The Court Clarifies the Relationship of Freedom of Movement to Union Citizenship	415
10.1	Attempting to Escape “Reverse Discrimination”	416
10.2	<i>O&B</i> : The Court Rules on “Returning” Union Citizens	422
10.2.1	“Genuine Residence” and Intent	422
10.2.2	The “Passporting” of Family Life	425
10.3	<i>S&G</i> : The Court Rules on “Residentially Sedentary” Union Citizens	426
10.3.1	Article 45 TFEU	426
10.4	Conclusion: The Shift from the “Market” Citizen to the “Residence” Citizen	431
	References	435
11	Conclusions	437
11.1	Review	439
11.1.1	Vertical and Horizontal Equalities in the US	439
11.1.2	Vertical and Horizontal Equalities in the European Community	441
11.1.3	European Union Citizenship and the Frontiers of Its Development	442
11.2	Conclusions by Theme	444
11.2.1	Inequalities	444
11.2.2	People(s) and Representation	446
11.2.3	Citizenship’s Emergence from a Struggle Against Resistance to Equality	447
11.2.4	Mobility and Family	451
11.3	The Union’s Vertical Citizenship: <i>contra</i> <i>Magnette</i> and <i>Schönberger</i>	454
11.4	Epilogue: Two Children Named <i>Ruiz</i>	458
	References	460
	Cases Cited	461
	Index	471