

Collective Redress and Private International Law in the EU

Thijs Bosters

Collective Redress and Private International Law in the EU



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Thijs Bosters
Supreme Court of the Netherlands
The Hague
The Netherlands

ISBN 978-94-6265-185-2 ISBN 978-94-6265-186-9 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-186-9

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017940363

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2017

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany
The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

*Issues regarding jurisdiction and the
recognition and enforcement of judgments in
cross-border mass disputes relating to
financial services*

M.W.F. Bosters

This book is made possible by:

● **NautaDutilh**



Stichting ter bevordering van internationaal
privaatrechtelijk onderzoek

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Collective Redress and Cross-Border Mass Disputes	1
1.2	Parameters of This Book	4
1.3	Book Structure	8
1.4	Typologies/Classifications of Collective Redress Mechanisms in the EU	9
1.4.1	Public Law Mechanisms and Private Law Mechanisms	9
1.4.2	Aggregate Litigation and Representative Litigation	11
1.5	Goals of Collective Redress Mechanisms	14
1.5.1	Introduction	14
1.5.2	Efficient Legal Protection	15
1.5.3	Effective Legal Protection	17
1.5.4	Reduction of the Administrative Burden on the Judiciary	17
1.6	Goals of the Brussels Regulation	18
1.6.1	Introduction	18
1.6.2	Free Movement of Judgments	19
1.6.3	Rights of the Defence	19
1.6.4	Legal Certainty	20
1.6.5	Resolving a Dispute Before an Appropriate Court	21
	References	22
 Part I Collective Redress Mechanisms in the EU		
2	German KapMuG Procedure	27
2.1	Introduction	27
2.2	Deutsche Telekom and KapMuG History	29
2.3	How a KapMuG Procedure Is Initiated	31
2.4	What Plaintiffs Can Achieve Through a KapMuG Procedure	33

2.5	Recent Experience with the Act, and Future Developments	33
	References.	34
3	Dutch Collective Action.	35
3.1	Introduction	35
3.2	History of Collective Action.	36
3.3	Parties That Can Bring a Collective Action?	37
3.4	Criteria for Bringing a Collective Action	38
3.5	The Result of Bringing a Collective Action	39
3.6	Recent Experience with Collective Actions	41
3.7	Future Developments	42
	References.	44
4	Dutch WCAM Procedure	47
4.1	Collective Settlement History	47
4.2	The Conditions for Arranging a WCAM Settlement.	48
4.3	What Can Eventually Be Achieved with a WCAM Settlement	50
4.4	WCAM Case Law	50
4.4.1	Dexia Case	51
4.4.2	Vedior Case.	52
4.4.3	Shell Case	52
4.4.4	Converium Case	54
4.5	Current and Future Developments	56
4.5.1	Amendments to the WCAM	56
4.5.2	Preliminary Questions Supreme Court.	57
	References.	59
 Part II Jurisdiction in Cross-Border Mass Disputes		
5	Jurisdiction and the KapMuG	63
5.1	Introduction	66
5.2	Submission.	67
5.3	Jurisdiction in Consumer-Related Matters.	69
5.3.1	Application of Chapter II, Section 4 Brussels I-Bis.	69
5.3.2	Jurisdiction in KapMuG Procedure Relating to Financial Products.	72
5.4	Choice of Forum Agreement	73
5.4.1	Choice of Forum Agreement in Consumer-Related Matters	74
5.4.2	Choice of Forum Agreement in Non-Consumer-Related Matters.	78
5.4.3	Conclusion	82
5.5	General Provision	83

- 5.6 Jurisdiction in Contractual Matters 84
 - 5.6.1 Various Places of Performance 86
- 5.7 Jurisdiction in Tortious Matters 87
 - 5.7.1 Place Where the Harmful Event Occurred
or May Occur 88
- 5.8 Effect of Grounds of Jurisdiction on the Goals of Collective
Redress 92
 - 5.8.1 Effective Legal Protection 92
 - 5.8.2 Efficient Legal Protection 95
 - 5.8.3 Administrative Burden of the Judiciary 97
- References. 99
- 6 Jurisdiction and the Dutch Collective Action 101**
 - 6.1 Introduction 101
 - 6.2 Submission Rule. 103
 - 6.3 Jurisdiction in Consumer-Related Matters. 104
 - 6.4 Choice of Forum Agreement 105
 - 6.4.1 Mass Dispute Relating to a Financial Product. 106
 - 6.4.2 Securities Mass Dispute. 109
 - 6.5 General Provision 110
 - 6.6 Jurisdiction in Contractual Matters 110
 - 6.7 Jurisdiction in Tortious Matters 112
 - 6.8 Effect of Grounds of Jurisdiction on the Goals of Collective
Redress 114
 - 6.8.1 Effective Legal Protection 114
 - 6.8.2 Efficient Legal Protection 116
 - 6.8.3 Administrative Burden of the Judiciary 117
 - 6.9 Conclusions 118
 - References. 118
- 7 Jurisdiction and the WCAM 119**
 - 7.1 Introduction 119
 - 7.2 Procedural Role of Parties and Applicability of the Brussels
Regulation 121
 - 7.3 Submission Rule. 123
 - 7.4 Jurisdiction in Consumer-Related Matters. 125
 - 7.5 Choice of Forum Agreement 126
 - 7.5.1 Choice of Forum Agreement Between the Victims
and the Perpetrator 127
 - 7.5.2 Choice of Forum Agreement as Part of the Settlement
Agreement. 128
 - 7.6 General Provision and Co-Defendants 129
 - 7.6.1 Co-Defendants Pursuant to Article 8(1)
Brussels I-Bis 133

7.7 Jurisdiction in Contractual Matters 134

7.8 Jurisdiction in Tortious Matters 137

7.9 Effect of Ground of Jurisdiction on the Goals of Collective Redress 137

 7.9.1 Effective Legal Protection and Finality 138

 7.9.2 Efficient Legal Protection 139

 7.9.3 Administrative Burden of the Judiciary 141

 7.9.4 Conclusion 141

References. 142

8 Parallel Proceedings 145

8.1 Introduction 145

8.2 Lis Pendens 146

 8.2.1 Requirements. 146

 8.2.2 Application of Lis Pendens Rule to Collective Redress Mechanisms 147

8.3 Related Actions 150

 8.3.1 Requirements. 150

 8.3.2 Application of Related Actions Rule to Collective Redress Mechanisms 151

8.4 Conclusions 154

8.5 Parallel Proceedings and Collective Redress Goals. 154

References. 157

Part III Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Collective Redress Judgments

9 Goals of the Brussels Regulation Regarding Jurisdiction 159

9.1 Interim Conclusions Regarding Jurisdiction 159

9.2 Goals of the Brussels Regulation 160

 9.2.1 Legal Certainty 160

 9.2.2 Most Appropriate Court. 163

 9.2.3 Preliminary Conclusions 165

Reference 166

10 Recognition and Enforcement of KapMuG Judgments 169

10.1 Introduction 171

10.2 ‘Judgment’ or Court Settlement? 172

10.3 Non-Recognition and Non-Enforcement of a KapMuG Judgment 174

 10.3.1 Public Policy. 175

 10.3.2 Defaulting Defendant. 177

 10.3.3 Irreconcilable Judgment. 178

10.3.4	Conflict with a Judgment Given in Another Member State	180
10.3.5	Summary	181
10.4	Goals of Collective Redress	182
	References.	183
11	Recognition and Enforcement in Relation to a Collective Action Procedure.	185
11.1	Introduction	185
11.2	Cross-Border Effect on Third Parties	186
11.3	Enforcement in a Collective Action Procedure	189
11.4	Non-Recognition and Non-Enforcement in a Collective Action Procedure	189
11.4.1	Defaulting Defendant.	190
11.4.2	Public Policy.	191
11.4.3	Irreconcilable Judgment.	192
11.4.4	Conflict with Judgment Given in Another Member State	193
11.4.5	Summary	194
11.5	Goals of Collective Redress	195
	References.	197
12	Recognition and Enforcement of a WCAM Judgment	199
12.1	Introduction	199
12.2	‘Judgment’ or Court Settlement	200
12.3	Enforcement of a WCAM Judgment.	203
12.4	Non-Recognition and Non-Enforcement of a WCAM Judgment	203
12.5	Defaulting Defendant	203
12.5.1	Public Policy.	205
12.5.2	Irreconcilable Judgment.	209
12.5.3	Conflict with Judgment Given in Another Member State	209
12.5.4	Summary	210
12.6	Goals of Collective Redress	211
	References.	212
13	Goals of the Brussels Regulation Regarding Recognition and Enforcement.	213
13.1	Interim Conclusions Regarding Recognition and Enforcement.	213
13.2	Goals of the Brussels Regulation	214

Part IV Making Cross-Border Collective Redress Possible

14 Summary	221
14.1 Typologies of Collective Redress Mechanisms	221
14.2 Application of the Rules on Jurisdiction	223
14.2.1 KapMuG Procedure	223
14.2.2 Dutch Collective Action	225
14.2.3 WCAM Procedure	226
14.2.4 Lis Pendens Rule	226
14.3 Application of the Rules of Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Judgments	227
14.3.1 KapMuG Procedure	227
14.3.2 Collective Action	228
14.3.3 WCAM Procedure	228
14.4 Principles of Collective Redress and the Brussels Regulation	229
14.4.1 Principles of Collective Redress	230
14.4.2 Goals of the Brussels Regulation	233
14.5 Applicability of Brussels Regulation and Recommendations ...	235
Reference	239
15 Relevant Developments and Possible Future Research	241
15.1 Introduction	241
15.2 Consultation ‘Towards a Coherent Approach to Collective Redress’	242
15.3 Recommendation ‘Towards a European Horizontal Framework for Collective Redress’	244
15.4 IBA Guidelines	246
15.5 Insolvency Regulation	246
15.6 Alternative Solutions and Possible Future Research	248
References	251
Bibliography	253
Case Law	261
Curriculum Vitae	265
Index	267

Glossary/Abbreviations

ADR	Alternative dispute resolution
Collective redress mechanism	Procedural mechanism through which a mass dispute can be resolved
DCC	Dutch Civil Code (or <i>Burgerlijk Wetboek (BW)</i>)
DCCP	Dutch Code of Civil Procedures (or <i>Wetboek van Burgerlijke Rechtsvordering (RV)</i>)
ECJ	European Court of Justice or Court of Justice of the EU
HR	Dutch Supreme Court (<i>Hoge Raad</i>)
KapMuG	German Capital Market Model Case Act (<i>Kapitalanleger Musterverfahrensgesetz</i>)
Mass dispute	Disputes involving numerous claimants by means of a single action or procedure
NIPR	Journal of Dutch Private International Law (<i>Nederlands Internationaal Privaatrecht</i>)
PIL	Private international law
Plaintiff	A victim that has started a collective procedure to resolve a mass dispute
Interest group	Entity promoting the interests of the various individual claimants/victims in a mass dispute (e.g. the foundation or association that represents the interests of a group of victims in both the collective action procedure and the WCAM procedure)
Standard redress mechanisms	Redress mechanisms used in disputes between two parties
WCAM	Collective Settlement Act (<i>Wet collectieve afwikkeling massaschade</i>)