

International Criminal Justice Series

Volume 14

Series editors

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Lovell Fernandez, Bellville, South Africa

Moritz Vormbaum, Berlin, Germany

Series Information

The *International Criminal Justice Series* aims to create a platform for publications in the whole field of international criminal justice. It, therefore, deals with issues relating, among others, to:

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

The series concentrates on themes pertinent to developing countries. It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars, in particular from African countries.

Editorial Office

Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Faculty of Law
Unter den Linden 6,
10099 Berlin, Germany
gerhard.werle@rewi.hu-berlin.de
moritz.vormbaum@rewi.hu-berlin.de

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/13470>

Leonie Steinl

Child Soldiers as Agents of War and Peace

A Restorative Transitional Justice Approach
to Accountability for Crimes Under
International Law



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Leonie Steinel
Faculty of Law
Humboldt University of Berlin
Berlin
Germany

ISSN 2352-6718 ISSN 2352-6726 (electronic)
International Criminal Justice Series
ISBN 978-94-6265-200-2 ISBN 978-94-6265-201-9 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-201-9

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017943238

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2017

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany
The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

Acknowledgements

This book is based on a dissertation which was defended at the University of Hamburg on the 4th of October 2016. First of all, I would like to thank my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Florian Jeßberger, for his invaluable support. His encouragement and keen interest in this project have provided me with a continuous source of motivation throughout the writing process. Secondly, I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle for his helpful feedback and suggestions at the final stage of this project.

I would further like to thank my professors at Columbia Law School, whom I have had the privilege to meet during my LL.M. studies in 2013/2014. These are: Prof. Robert Ferguson, who has shaped my way of thinking about punishment and restorative justice; Prof. Graeme Simpson, from whom I have learned so much about transitional justice; Prof. Katherine Franke, who helped me to explore the gendered dimensions of child soldiering; and Prof. Jane Spinak, who challenged me to move from theory to practice. I also thank Radhika Coomaraswamy, who shared with us her experiences as the former SRSG on Children and Armed Conflict during her seminar on Children and Armed Conflict at NYU Law School.

I am indebted to Virginie Ladisch and Rachel Goodman from the Children and Youth Program of the International Center for Transitional Justice, with whom I was able to discuss my ideas and who have helped me greatly in developing them further.

I thank the Friedrich Naumann Foundation for Liberty for the financial support, enabling the writing of the dissertation which led to this book.

Lastly, I take this opportunity to thank my parents and my partner Jakob for everything, but especially for their love, encouragement, and support.

Contents

1	An Introduction to Child Soldiering, Its Images, and Realities	1
1.1	Introduction	2
1.1.1	Aim and Structure of the Book	4
1.1.2	Definition of the Term Child Soldier	5
1.1.3	Child Soldiers in International Law	7
1.2	Images of Child Soldiers and Their Influence on International Policy	9
1.2.1	The Passive Victim Image	9
1.2.2	The Dangerous Demon Image	11
1.2.3	Common Features	12
1.2.4	Influence on International Policy	12
1.2.5	The Hero Image	13
1.3	Child Soldiers' Experiences and Their Gendered Dimensions	14
1.3.1	Recruitment	15
1.3.2	Experiences During Conflict	18
1.3.3	Post-conflict Experiences	22
1.4	The Ambivalence of the Passive Victim Discourse	26
1.4.1	Adverse Consequences of the Passive Victim Image	27
1.4.2	Conclusion: The Need to Acknowledge Child Soldiers' Agency	33
1.5	Agency and Accountability	34
	References	37
2	Child Soldiers and Non-Prosecutorial Transitional Justice	45
2.1	Introduction	46
2.2	Transitional Justice	47
2.3	Truth Commissions	51
2.3.1	South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission	51
2.3.2	Sierra Leone's Truth and Reconciliation Commission	54

2.3.3	Liberia's Truth and Reconciliation Commission	61
2.3.4	Conclusion	67
2.4	Traditional Processes	68
2.4.1	Traditional Justice Processes	68
2.4.2	Traditional Cleansing Processes in Uganda, Angola, Mozambique, and Sierra Leone	80
2.5	Amnesties	86
2.5.1	Mozambique	87
2.5.2	South Africa	88
2.5.3	Sierra Leone	91
2.5.4	Uganda	94
2.5.5	Liberia	102
2.5.6	Conclusion	105
2.6	Reparations	106
2.6.1	Introduction	106
2.6.2	Child Soldiers' Right to Reparations	108
2.6.3	Implementation of Reparations for Child Soldiers	117
2.7	Institutional Reform: Disarmament Demobilization and Reintegration Programs	129
2.8	Conclusion	134
	References	137
3	Child Soldiers and Prosecutorial Transitional Justice	145
3.1	Introduction	146
3.2	Criminal Responsibility and Prosecution	147
3.2.1	Statutes and Case Law of International and Internationalized Courts	148
3.2.2	Domestic Case Law and Legislation	162
3.2.3	International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights Law as Limitations to Prosecution?	190
3.2.4	Customary International Law and General Principles of Law	201
3.2.5	Conclusion	215
3.3	The Duty to Prosecute Crimes Under International Law	215
3.3.1	The Authority to Prosecute	216
3.3.2	The Duty to Prosecute	218
3.4	Selected Topics in Substantive International Criminal Law	233
3.4.1	The Mental Element of Crimes Under International Law and the Principle of Culpability	234
3.4.2	Grounds for Excluding Criminal Responsibility	244
3.4.3	Superior Responsibility	260
3.4.4	Conclusion	262

3.5	Procedural Rights	263
3.5.1	The Convention on the Rights of the Child	264
3.5.2	The African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child.	266
3.5.3	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.	267
3.5.4	Conclusion	268
3.6	Sentencing	270
3.6.1	Mitigating Factors in International Criminal Law	271
3.6.2	Conclusion	274
3.7	Conclusion	275
	References.	278
4	Child Soldiers and Restorative Transitional Justice	289
4.1	Introduction	290
4.2	Restorative Justice	291
4.2.1	Theoretical Foundation and Practical Application	291
4.2.2	Restorative Justice and Juvenile Justice.	307
4.3	Restorative Transitional Justice.	313
4.3.1	The Practical Application of Restorative Justice in Transitional Settings	314
4.3.2	Restorative Justice and Crimes Under International Law	318
4.3.3	Restorative Transitional Justice: A Conceptualization	332
4.4	Restorative Transitional Justice for Child Soldiers	364
4.4.1	Restorative Transitional Justice as a Child-Adequate Pathway to Accountability and Reintegration	366
4.4.2	Restorative Transitional Justice Processes for Child Soldiers	368
4.4.3	Practical Implementation	394
	References.	396
5	Summary and Conclusions	409
	Index	419

Abbreviations

ACRWC	African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child
AFRC	Armed Forces Revolutionary Council
ANC	African National Congress
CDF	Civil Defense Forces
CPN	Child Protection Network
CPU	Child Protection Unit
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
DDR	Disarmament Demobilization and Reintegration
DRC	Democratic Republic of the Congo
ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers of the Courts of Cambodia
FARC	Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTJ	International Center for Transitional Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for Yugoslavia
ILO	International Labour Organization
IOM	International Organization for Migration
JLOS	Justice, Law and Order Sector
JRP	Justice and Reconciliation Project
LRA	Lord's Resistance Army
MACR	Minimum Age of Criminal Responsibility
NCSA	National Commission for Social Action
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
RENAMO	Resistência Nacional Moçambicana

RUF	Revolutionary United Front
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
SLA	Sierra Leone Army
SPDDC	Special Panels of the Dili District Court
SRSR	Special Representative of the Secretary-General
SWAY	Survey of War-Affected Youth
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UDF	United Democratic Front
UK	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UN IDDRS	United Nations Integrated Disarmament Demobilization and Reintegration Standards
UNTAET	United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor
UNTAET TRCP	United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor Transitional Rules of Criminal Procedure
UPC	Union of Congolese Patriots
UPDF	Uganda People's Defence Force
US/USA	United States of America
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WCCBiH	War Crimes Chamber in the Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina