

Maritime Interception and the Law of Naval Operations

Martin Fink

Maritime Interception and the Law of Naval Operations

A Study of Legal Bases and Legal Regimes
in Maritime Interception Operations



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Martin Fink
Royal Netherlands Navy
The Hague
The Netherlands

ISBN 978-94-6265-248-4 ISBN 978-94-6265-249-1 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-249-1>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018941214

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2018

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE part of Springer Nature
The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

Acknowledgements

This study on maritime interception operations and international law is the result of my doctoral thesis, which I finished in 2016 at the University of Amsterdam. That thesis could not have been finished without the guidance and patience of my supervisor professor Terry Gill. I was privileged that I was given the opportunity to learn from him and study the international law of military operations under his wings.

As a legal officer in the Royal Netherlands Navy, the Navy provided me with the much wanted and needed experience to understand the real world of military operations. But it also gave me a reason and a basis for my academic explorations. I was lucky enough that the Royal Netherlands Navy allowed me to spend time overseas on military operations and in the academic arena, a combination that has been the fruitful soil for this book.

Looking back at the process of ultimately finishing this study, two additional reasons have made it possible. The first is that I simply enjoyed writing this book. As a labor of solace, giving me some satisfaction when adventures were too far beyond the horizon for me to see them. Second, and much more important, I was given the opportunity and time to actually write it. Because Emilie, throughout all the stages of the process, was there to command our ship, even more so when our ship grew out to become a fleet of one heavy cruiser surrounded by many small destroyers, who all wanted to sail their own course. And if writing my thesis was not enough, I extended her ordeal even more by putting her through the production of a more publishable version. And again, her patience and tight command of our fleet has pulled us through safely.

Contents

Part I General Aspects of Maritime Interception Operations

1 Introduction: Maritime Interception and the Law of Naval Operations	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 Purpose of the Study	6
1.2.1 Naval Operations and International Peace and Security	6
1.2.2 Operations Outside the Territorial Sovereignty of a State	8
1.2.3 Contemporary Naval Operations	9
1.3 What Are Maritime Interception Operations?	10
1.4 Maritime Interception Operations and the Right of Visit	14
1.5 Structure	16
References	17
2 Some Introductory Remarks on Naval Operations	19
2.1 Introduction	19
2.2 Evolution of the Role of Naval Forces	20
2.3 Maritime Geography	24
2.4 Some Operational Points on MIO	26
2.4.1 Maritime Coalition Operations	26
2.4.2 Boarding Operations	27
2.4.3 Maritime Rules of Engagement	28
References	30
3 A Short History of Maritime Interception Operations	33
3.1 Introduction	34
3.2 Strand 1: Enforcing UN Sanctions at Sea	35
3.2.1 Iraq (1990–2003)	36
3.2.2 The Former Yugoslavia (1992–1996)	37

3.2.3	Haiti (1993–1996)	39
3.2.4	Sierra Leone (1997–2010)	39
3.2.5	Lebanon (2006–Present)	40
3.2.6	Libya (2011–Present)	41
3.3	Strand 2: The September 11 Attacks	42
3.3.1	Operation <i>Enduring Freedom</i>	43
3.3.2	Operation <i>Active Endeavour</i>	43
3.3.3	Operation <i>Iraqi Freedom</i>	44
3.3.4	Multiple MIO	45
3.4	Strand 3: Enhancing Maritime Security	47
3.4.1	Expanded MIO and Maritime Security Operations (MSO)	47
3.4.2	Proliferation Security Initiative (PSI)	48
3.4.3	Updating International Agreements: The SUA Protocol 2005	50
3.5	Strand 4: Piracy	50
3.5.1	Counter-Piracy Operations	51
3.6	The Israeli Interception Operations	54
3.7	Final Remarks	55
	References	56
4	The Right for Warships to Intervene on Foreign-Flagged Vessels on the High Seas	61
4.1	Introduction	61
4.2	Fundamental Principles of the Law of the Sea	62
4.3	Limited Exceptions to Non-Interference	65
4.4	Principles of the Law of the Sea Versus Maritime Security	67
	References	69
 Part II Legal Basis for Maritime Interception Operations		
5	The UN Collective Security System and Maritime Interception Operations	73
5.1	Introduction	74
5.2	The UN Collective Security System	75
5.3	Maritime Embargo Operations	77
5.3.1	Two Types of Maritime Embargo Operations	78
5.3.2	Explicit Maritime Embargo Operations	82
5.4	Between Implied and Explicit	83
5.4.1	Lebanon	83
5.4.2	Iran	85
5.4.3	Libya	86

- 5.5 Legal Basis for Explicit Maritime Embargo Operations: Article 41 or 42? 86
 - 5.5.1 The Evolving Scope of Article 42 87
 - 5.5.2 Large-Scale Military Operations 88
 - 5.5.3 Article 43 UN Charter 90
 - 5.5.4 Inadequate Measures Under Article 41 91
- 5.6 Article 41 and the Use of Force 91
- 5.7 Sub-Conclusion Maritime Embargo Operations 94
- 5.8 UN-Mandated Interception Operations Under ‘All Necessary Means’ 96
 - 5.8.1 All Necessary Means 96
- 5.9 Specific Measures 97
 - 5.9.1 “Article 42” Blockade 98
 - 5.9.2 Piracy 99
 - 5.9.3 Weapons of Mass Destruction and Terrorism 100
 - 5.9.4 Crude Oil Export: Libya 2014 102
- 5.10 Conclusions 102
- References 103
- 6 Self-Defence and Maritime Interception 107**
 - 6.1 Introduction 108
 - 6.2 The Right of Self-Defence 109
 - 6.3 Large-Scale Military Campaigns 111
 - 6.3.1 Iraq (1990–1991) 111
 - 6.3.2 *Enduring Freedom, Change of Direction and Cast Lead* 112
 - 6.3.3 *Operation Active Endeavour* 113
 - 6.4 Self-Defence Against Vessel-Borne WMD and Non-State Actors 114
 - 6.4.1 WMD and Armed Attack 115
 - 6.4.2 Reaction to Armed Attack: Flag State Jurisdiction and Self-Defence 117
 - 6.4.3 Advantages of the *Ius ad Bellum* Approach to Boarding 119
 - 6.5 Final Remarks 121
 - References 122
- 7 (Ad Hoc) Consent 125**
 - 7.1 Introduction 125
 - 7.2 Legal Framework Consent 128
 - 7.2.1 The Consenting Authority 129
 - 7.3 Analysis 132
 - 7.3.1 The “Broken Taillight-Approach” 133
 - 7.4 Stateless Vessels 135

7.4.1	Conditions for Statelessness as a Legal Basis	136
7.5	Final Remarks	137
	References	138
8	International Agreements on Maritime Interception	141
8.1	Introduction	141
8.2	The Increasing Role of International Agreements in MIO	143
8.3	International Agreements and the Law of the Sea	145
8.4	UNCLOS	147
8.5	The SUA Convention and Protocol	149
8.6	PSI Bilateral Boarding Agreements Between the US and Others	149
8.7	Final Remarks	150
	References	150
 Part III Legal Regimes for Maritime Interception Operations		
9	The Right of Visit	155
9.1	Introduction	156
9.2	General Remarks on the Right of Visit	157
9.3	Ad Hoc Consent-Based Right of Visit	159
9.4	International Agreements and the Right of Visit	160
9.4.1	The Limited Character of the Right of Visit in UNCLOS	160
9.4.2	The SUA Provisions	164
9.4.3	Bilateral Ship Boarding Agreements Between the US and Other States	165
9.5	Self-Defence and the Right of Visit	165
9.5.1	The Belligerent Right of Visit and Search	166
9.5.2	The Subregimes of the Law of Naval Warfare	169
9.6	Non-International Armed Conflicts	173
9.6.1	Operation <i>Enduring Freedom</i>	174
9.6.2	Operation <i>Active Endeavour</i>	177
9.6.3	A NIAC Right of Visit?	178
9.7	The Right of Visit Conferred Through the UN Collective Security System	180
9.7.1	All Necessary Means	184
9.7.2	The Law of Blockade and Article 42 of the UN Charter	185
9.8	Final Remarks	186
	References	187

10 The Application of Force in Maritime Interception Operations 191

10.1 Introduction 192

10.2 Naval Forces and the Use of Force 194

10.3 International Law of the Sea 195

10.4 Applicability of Human Rights to High Seas Interceptions . . . 199

10.5 The Right to Life in a Naval Operations Dimension 204

 10.5.1 Counter-Piracy Operations off the Coast of Somalia 206

10.6 The Law of Armed Conflict. 208

 10.6.1 Use of Force Against Neutral and Enemy Merchant Vessels 210

 10.6.2 Use of Force Under the Prize Law Rules 215

10.7 Human Rights Law and the Law of Naval Warfare 217

10.8 Use of Force in UN-Mandated Interception Operations 219

10.9 Use of Self-Defence Interception Operations 222

10.10 Final Remarks 223

References 224

11 Detention and Maritime Interception 227

11.1 Introduction 228

11.2 Operational Detention 229

11.3 What Constitutes Detention During Maritime Interception Operations 230

11.4 Prisoners of War at Sea and Crews of Enemy and Neutral Merchant Vessels 232

 11.4.1 Passengers 233

11.5 Security Detainees at Sea. 234

 11.5.1 Security Detention Under LOAC 234

 11.5.2 Security Detention Under Human Rights Law 236

11.6 Criminal Detention 237

11.7 Safeguards and Treatment at Sea 239

11.8 Detention in UN-Mandated Maritime Interception Operations 242

11.9 The *Freedom Flotilla* Incident 245

11.10 Final Remarks 248

References 249

Part IV Conclusions

12 Conclusions 253

12.1 Introduction 253

12.2 Legal Bases for MIO 255

12.3	Legal Regimes in MIO	257
12.4	Final Remarks	259
	References	260
	Annex A: List of Vessels	261
	Annex B: List of Incidents	263
	Annex C: List of Naval Operations	269
	Annex D: Table of UN-Mandated Maritime Embargo Operations	271
	Table of Cases	273
	Literature	275
	Index	313

Abbreviations

AAV	Approach and assist visits
AFOR	Allied Force
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
AMISOM	African Union Mission in Somalia
AMO	Area of maritime operations
AMS	Allied maritime strategy
API	First Additional Protocol to the Geneva Convention (1977)
APII	Second Additional Protocol to the Geneva Convention (1977)
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
ATP	Allied tactical publication
BSA	Bilateral shipboarding agreements
BWC	Biological Weapons Convention
BYBIL	British Yearbook of International Law
CA 3	Common Article 3 of the Geneva Conventions
CENTCOM	Central Command
Chap.	Chapter
CHS	Convention on the High Seas
CJA	Council joint action
CMF	Combined maritime forces
CPA	Coalition provisional authority
CPERS	Captured persons
CTF	Combined taskforce
CWC	Chemical Weapons Convention
CYIL	Canadian Yearbook of International Law
DILS	Defense Institute of Legal Studies
DPH	Direct participation in hostilities
ECA	Effective control over an area
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECJ	European Court of Justice

ECOMOG	ECOWAS monitoring group
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
ECtHR	European Court for Human Rights
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
E-MIO	Expanded maritime interception operations
EU	European Union
EUMSS	European Union maritime security strategy
EUNAVFOR	European Union naval force
GC (I-IV)	Geneva Convention (1949) (I-IV)
GIA	Governor's Island Agreement
GMO	Grondslagen van het maritiem optreden (fundaments of naval operations)
GWOT	Global war on terror
HC	Hague Convention
Hr. Ms.	Hare Majesteits (Her Majesty)
HRC	Human Rights Council
HSC	High Seas Convention (1958)
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Convention on Civil and Political Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IDF	Israel Defense Forces
IHL	International humanitarian law
IHRL	International human rights law
IHT	International Herald Tribune
ILC	International Law Commission
ILMO	International law of military operations
ILS	International law studies
IRRC	International Review of the Red Cross
IRTC	Internationally recognized transit corridor
ISAF	International Security and Assistance Force
ITLOS	International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea
IUU	Illegal, Unreported, Unregulated
IYIL	Israel Yearbook of International Law
LAF	Lebanese Armed Forces
LD	London Declaration
LEDET	Law enforcement detachments
LIO	Leadership interdiction operation
LJIL	Leiden Journal of International Law
LOAC	Law of armed conflict
MDA	Maritime domain awareness
MEO	Maritime embargo operation
MEZ	Maritime exclusion zone
MIF	Maritime interception force

MIO	Maritime interception operation
MNF-I	Multinational Force Iraq
MRT	Militair Rechtelijk Tijdschrift (Netherlands Military Law Journal)
MSA	Maritime security awareness
MSO	Maritime security operations
MTF UNIFIL	Maritime Task Force United Nations Interim Force in Lebanon
NAC	North Atlantic Council
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NFZ	No fly zone
NGS	Naval gunfire support
NILR	Netherlands International Law Review
NJB	Nederlands Juristenblad
NLMARFOR	Netherlands maritime force
NLR	Naval Law Review
NMIOTC	NATO maritime interdiction operations training center
NNN	Non NATO Nations
NPT	Non-proliferation treaty
NWCR	Naval War College Review
NYIL	Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
OAE	Operation Active Endeavour
OAP	Operation Allied Protector (I)/Provider (II)
OCD	Operation Change Direction
OCL	Operation Cast Lead
ODIL	Ocean Development and International Law
OEF	Operation Enduring Freedom
OIF	Operation Iraqi Freedom
OOD	Operation Odyssey Dawn
OOS	Operation Ocean Shield
OSG	Operation Sea Guardian
OUP	Operation Unified Protector
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration
PICJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PSI	Proliferation Security Initiative
PSO	Peace support operations
PW	Prisoners of war
Rhib	Rigid hull inflatable boats
RNLN	Royal Netherlands Navy
ROE	Rules of engagement
SAA	State agent authority
SACEUR	Supreme Allied Commander Europe
SC Res.	Security Council Resolution
SFIR	Stabilization Force Iraq
SHADE	Shared awareness and deconfliction (-meeting)

SNMG	Standing NATO maritime group
SRM	San Remo Manual
STANAVFORMED	Standing Naval Forces Mediterranean
STROGOPS	Strait of Gibraltar Operations
SUA	Convention on the suppression of unlawful acts at sea
TFG	Transitional federal government
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNBEF	United Nations blockading and escorting force
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNFICYP	United Nations Force in Cyprus
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNIFIL	United Nations Interim Force in Lebanon
UNMIH	United Nations Mission in Haiti
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSG	United Nations Secretary-General
US	United States of America
USS	United States Ship
VJIL	Virginia Journal of International Law
VPD	Vessel protection detachment
WEU	West European Union
WFP	World Food Program
WMD	Weapons of mass destruction
YIHL	Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law
YILC	Yearbook of the International Law Commission
Zr. Ms.	Zijne Majesteits (His Majesty)