

# **International Criminal Justice Series**

Volume 16

## **Series editors**

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Moritz Vormbaum, Berlin, Germany

## **Series Information**

The *International Criminal Justice Series* aims to create a platform for publications in the whole field of international criminal justice. It, therefore, deals with issues relating, among others, to:

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

The series concentrates on themes pertinent to developing countries. It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars, in particular from African countries.

## **Editorial Office**

Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle  
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin  
Faculty of Law  
Unter den Linden 6,  
10099 Berlin, Germany  
gerhard.werle@rewi.hu-berlin.de  
moritz.vormbaum@rewi.hu-berlin.de

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/13470>

Kelly Pitcher

# Judicial Responses to Pre-Trial Procedural Violations in International Criminal Proceedings



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Kelly Pitcher  
Department of Criminal Law  
and Criminal Procedure  
Leiden University  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

ISSN 2352-6718 ISSN 2352-6726 (electronic)  
International Criminal Justice Series  
ISBN 978-94-6265-218-7 ISBN 978-94-6265-219-4 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-219-4>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017954483

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands [www.asserpress.nl](http://www.asserpress.nl)  
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2018

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by Springer Nature  
The registered company is Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany  
The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

# **Acknowledgements**

This book is the result of doctoral research conducted between 2009 and 2016 at the University of Amsterdam. During this time, I benefitted from the able guidance of professors Tom Blom and Göran Sluiter, and the support of the Department of Criminal Law and Criminal Procedure, for which I am grateful. To Egbert, Edie, Robert and Pieter and to my family, I am grateful for everything.

# Contents

<b>1 Introduction</b> . . . . .	1
1.1 Framing the Issue . . . . .	2
1.2 Purpose of the Book . . . . .	4
1.3 Delineation and Definitions . . . . .	6
1.4 Outline . . . . .	9
References . . . . .	12
<b>2 Human Rights Framework</b> . . . . .	13
2.1 Introduction . . . . .	14
2.2 Protection of the Suspect or Accused . . . . .	18
2.2.1 Right to a Fair Trial . . . . .	18
2.2.2 Right to an Effective Remedy . . . . .	65
2.2.3 Right to Compensation in Case of Unlawful Arrest or Detention . . . . .	73
2.2.4 Procedural Violations in the Context of Inter-State Cooperation in Criminal Matters . . . . .	75
2.3 Protection of Others . . . . .	83
2.3.1 States' Duties in Responding to Serious Human Rights Violations . . . . .	84
2.3.2 Applicability of States' Duty to Prosecute to International Criminal Tribunals . . . . .	96
2.4 Conclusion . . . . .	98
References . . . . .	101
<b>3 Judicial Responses to Pre-Trial Procedural Violations in the Netherlands</b> . . . . .	105
3.1 Introduction . . . . .	106
3.2 Relevant Aspects of the Dutch Legal System . . . . .	107
3.3 Theoretical Framework: Possible Points of Departure and Specific Rationales . . . . .	110

3.3.1	The Concept of the Rule of Law . . . . .	111
3.3.2	The (Protection of the) Subjective Rights of the Accused . . . . .	119
3.3.3	The Need to Ensure the Accused's Right to a Fair Trial . . . . .	124
3.3.4	The Primacy of Crime Control . . . . .	125
3.4	Legal Framework . . . . .	126
3.4.1	Procedural Violations in the National Context . . . . .	126
3.4.2	Procedural Violations in an International Context . . . . .	160
3.5	Synthesis . . . . .	164
3.6	Conclusion . . . . .	175
	References . . . . .	177
<b>4</b>	<b>Judicial Responses to Pre-Trial Procedural Violations in England and Wales . . . . .</b>	<b>181</b>
4.1	Introduction . . . . .	182
4.2	Relevant Aspects of the English Legal System . . . . .	183
4.3	Theoretical Framework: Possible Rationales . . . . .	185
4.3.1	The Reliability Rationale . . . . .	186
4.3.2	The Disciplinary Rationale . . . . .	188
4.3.3	The Protective (or Remedial) Rationale . . . . .	189
4.3.4	The Integrity Rationale . . . . .	193
4.4	Legal Framework . . . . .	197
4.4.1	Procedural Violations in the National Context . . . . .	197
4.4.2	Procedural Violations in an International Context . . . . .	244
4.5	Synthesis . . . . .	247
4.6	Conclusion . . . . .	257
	References . . . . .	260
<b>5</b>	<b>Law and Practice of the International Criminal Tribunals—General Overview . . . . .</b>	<b>261</b>
5.1	Introduction . . . . .	262
5.2	Features of International Criminal Procedure . . . . .	263
5.3	Ad Hoc Tribunals . . . . .	269
5.3.1	Stay of Proceedings . . . . .	269
5.3.2	Exclusion of Evidence . . . . .	280
5.3.3	Financial Compensation . . . . .	298
5.3.4	Sentence Reduction . . . . .	302
5.3.5	Express Acknowledgement . . . . .	304
5.4	ICC . . . . .	305
5.4.1	Stay of Proceedings . . . . .	305
5.4.2	Exclusion of Evidence . . . . .	322
5.4.3	Financial Compensation . . . . .	333
5.4.4	Sentence Reduction . . . . .	337
5.4.5	Express Acknowledgement . . . . .	338

5.5	Comparison . . . . .	339
5.5.1	Stay of Proceedings . . . . .	339
5.5.2	Exclusion of Evidence . . . . .	344
5.5.3	Financial Compensation . . . . .	347
5.5.4	Sentence Reduction . . . . .	348
5.5.5	Express Acknowledgement . . . . .	348
5.6	Conclusion . . . . .	348
	References . . . . .	350
<b>6</b>	<b>Law and Practice of the International Criminal Tribunals—Specific Contexts . . . . .</b>	<b>353</b>
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	354
6.2	Judicial Responses to Procedural Violations Connected to Arrest and Detention . . . . .	356
6.2.1	Ad Hoc Tribunals . . . . .	356
6.2.2	ICC . . . . .	377
6.2.3	Comparison and Analysis . . . . .	389
6.3	Judicial Responses to Procedural Violations Connected to Disclosure . . . . .	397
6.3.1	Ad Hoc Tribunals . . . . .	398
6.3.2	ICC . . . . .	416
6.3.3	Comparison and Analysis . . . . .	427
6.4	Conclusion . . . . .	432
	References . . . . .	434
<b>7</b>	<b>Assessment of the International Criminal Tribunals’ Law and Practice . . . . .</b>	<b>437</b>
7.1	Introduction . . . . .	438
7.2	Evaluation in Light of Human Rights Standards . . . . .	439
7.2.1	The Right to a Fair Trial . . . . .	439
7.2.2	The Right to an Effective Remedy . . . . .	448
7.2.3	The Right to Compensation in Case of Unlawful Arrest or Detention . . . . .	455
7.2.4	Procedural Violations in the Context of Inter-State Cooperation in Criminal Matters . . . . .	457
7.3	Comparison to National Law and Practice . . . . .	460
7.3.1	Exclusion of Evidence . . . . .	461
7.3.2	Stay of Proceedings . . . . .	480
7.3.3	Other Responses . . . . .	498
7.3.4	Procedural Issues . . . . .	501
7.4	Further Analysis . . . . .	503
7.4.1	The Most Suitable Rationale for Responding to Procedural Violations . . . . .	504



7.4.2	The Merits of Judicial Discretion . . . . .	511
7.4.3	The Distinctive Features of International Criminal Procedure . . . . .	515
7.5	Concluding Remarks . . . . .	518
	References . . . . .	518
<b>8</b>	<b>Conclusion</b> . . . . .	<b>521</b>
	References . . . . .	531
	<b>Bibliography</b> . . . . .	<b>533</b>
	<b>List of Cases</b> . . . . .	<b>543</b>
	<b>List of Instruments</b> . . . . .	<b>559</b>
	<b>Index</b> . . . . .	<b>563</b>