

International Criminal Justice Series

Volume 18

Series editors

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Moritz Vormbaum, Münster, Germany

Series Information

The series aims to create a platform for publications covering the entire field of international criminal justice. It therefore deals with issues relating, among others, to

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars.

Editorial Office

Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Faculty of Law
Unter den Linden 6,
10099 Berlin, Germany
gerhard.werle@rewi.hu-berlin.de
vormbaum@uni-muenster.de

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/13470>

Marshet Tadesse Tessema

Prosecution of Politicide in Ethiopia

The Red Terror Trials



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Marshet Tadesse Tessema
Law School
Jimma University
Jimma, Ethiopia

ISSN 2352-6718 ISSN 2352-6726 (electronic)
International Criminal Justice Series
ISBN 978-94-6265-254-5 ISBN 978-94-6265-255-2 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-255-2>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018945450

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2018

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE part of Springer Nature
The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

Acknowledgements

This book is based on a dissertation that was conducted under the auspices of the South African-German Centre for Transnational Criminal Justice, which is run cooperatively by the Law Faculties of the University of the Western Cape and Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin. It would not have come to fruition without the generous and unwavering support of a large number of people and institutions that I would now like to acknowledge and sincerely thank.

First, I extend my heartfelt gratitude to Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle of Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin and Co-director of the South African-German Centre for Transnational Criminal Justice, whose inspiration, constructive ideas, continuous support and guidance helped me greatly to accomplish this work. This text has immensely benefited from his constructive comments, both in terms of substance and form.

I also owe great thanks to Prof. Dr. Lovell Fernandez of University of the Western Cape and Co-director of the South African-German Centre for Transnational Criminal Justice, for his guidance, encouragement, and thoroughly editing this work. I also owe a debt of gratitude to Dr. Moritz Vormbaum, Coordinator of the Centre, for providing an invaluable guidance since I began working on this project and for his insightful comments on the manuscript.

I would also like to thank the *Deutscher Akademischer Austausch Dienst* (DAAD) for funding my research. My endeavour on the research would not have been possible without DAAD's financial support; hence, I am thankful for the financial support. Vielen Dank (Galaatooma/አመሰግናለሁ)! The research process leading to the finalization of this book was also supported in part by Open Society Foundations (OSF). The opinions expressed herein are the author's own and do not necessarily express the views of OSF. I am also grateful to Anja Schepke, Hazel Jeftha, and Farieda Hendricks for their excellent and unfailing administrative support throughout my research process.

My heartfelt gratitude also goes to staff members of the South African-German Centre, colleagues at the Chair of Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle of Humboldt University, the Red Terror Martyrs Museum in Addis, Prof. Martin Heger, Prof. Yonatan

Fisseha, Prof. Benyam Mezmur, Prof. Raymond Koen, Prof. Bernard Martin and Dr. Zemelak Ayele, for their support and encouragement during my research.

I am also truly grateful to my colleagues and friends Dr. Sosteness Materu, Windell Nortje, Dr. Jean Philipo, Dagim Melese, Markos Debebe, Seada Hussien, Aziz Epik, Marlen Vesper-Graske, Dr. Verena Zoppie, Tadesse Sime, and Zainabu Mango who supported me in one way or another in the course of conducting this research.

Finally yet importantly, I would like to thank my fiancé Elisabeth Abreham (Kiyaye), my parents, my grandmother Workenesh Manalhe, my siblings, and Yeshu for their unconditional love and unflinching support throughout writing this work and in my life in general.

Above all, I thank and praise God for His greatest Love, Grace, and Blessings!

Marshet Tadesse Tessema

Contents

1 Prefatory Part	1
1.1 General Introduction: Setting the Context	1
1.2 Objectives of the Book	10
1.3 Outline of the Book	10
References	11
2 Historical Survey of the <i>Derg</i> Regime and the Infamous Red Terror	15
2.1 The Prelude to the 1974 Revolution	15
2.2 From an Aristocratic Feudal Monarchy to the Dictatorial Military Junta	21
2.3 The Urban Opposition Against the <i>Derg</i>	29
2.4 The Genesis of the Red Terror and the White Terror	34
2.4.1 The Pre-September 1976 Terror	34
2.4.2 The Post-September 1976 Terror: <i>Qey Sheber</i>	36
2.5 Human Cost of the Terror: Quantification of the Victims	49
2.6 The War against the Insurgents in the North	52
2.6.1 Indiscriminate Bombardments	54
2.6.2 Creation of Famine and Manipulation of Aid	57
2.6.3 Forced Resettlement	58
2.7 The Demise of the Mengistu Regime and the Rise to Power of the Ethnic-based Insurgents	59
2.8 Interim Conclusion	60
References	61
3 The Ethiopian Legal Framework for the Prosecution of Crimes Under International Law	65
3.1 Introductory Remarks: Setting the Framework	65
3.2 A Brief Survey of the Regulation of Core Crimes Under Ethiopian Law	67

3.3	International Crimes Under the 1957 Penal Code	68
3.3.1	Genocide	68
3.3.2	Crimes Against Humanity	103
3.3.3	War Crimes	107
3.4	Modes of Participation Under the Penal Code	110
3.5	Defenses	118
3.6	Penalties	119
3.7	Interim Conclusion	120
	References	121
4	The Ethiopian Approach to Reckon with <i>Derg</i> Crimes: The Road to the Creation of the Special Public Prosecutor's Office	133
4.1	Overview of the Strategies to Confront a Repressive Past	133
4.2	Promulgation of the Interim Charter and the Establishment of the Transitional Government	143
4.3	Criminal Accountability as a Means to Confront <i>Derg</i> Crimes: The Establishment of the Special Public Prosecutors Office	146
4.3.1	Creation of the Special Public Prosecutor's Office and Establishment of a New Court System	148
4.3.2	The Judiciary and the Office of the Public Defender	158
4.4	Habeas Corpus Petitions of Detainees	161
4.5	Interim Conclusion	164
	References	164
5	Criminal Accountability for <i>Derg</i> Crimes: Prosecution of Politicide	171
5.1	The Special Public Prosecutor's Investigation and Prosecutorial Strategy	171
5.2	Terror on Trial: The Red Terror Trials	172
5.2.1	The Accused	173
5.2.2	Victims in the Red Terror Trials	175
5.3	The <i>SPP v Colonel Mengistu Haile-Mariam et al</i> : Filed First; Concluded Last	177
5.3.1	The Indictment	179
5.3.2	The Trial: Heads of State and Government on Trial	184
5.3.3	The Main Trial: Tendering Evidence and the Ruling of the Federal High Court	205
5.3.4	Conclusion of the Prolix Trial: The Verdict	209
5.3.5	Stocktaking of the Judgment: Evaluation	213
5.3.6	Sentencing Decision	214
5.3.7	Appellate Proceedings: Arguments of the Parties and Appellate Court's Decision	220
5.4	From Pardon to Release on Probation	231
	References	235

6 Stocktaking of the Red Terror Trials: Is It an Approach Worth Emulating? 241

6.1 Criticisms or Pitfalls of the Ethiopian Transition—The Red Terror Trials. 241

6.1.1 Trials of the Vanquished: Victor’s Justice 241

6.1.2 Trial *in Absentia*: Criminal Proceedings in the Absence of the Accused in the Dock 243

6.1.3 The Use of Capital Punishment 247

6.1.4 Protracted Proceedings and Their Implication for Fair Trial Rights. 255

6.1.5 Genocide or Not Debate: Did the Mengistu Regime Commit Genocide? 259

6.1.6 Offenders Oriented Approach: A Thin Slice of the Truth. 263

6.2 The Legacy of the Red Terror Trials to Ethiopia’s Transition from the *Derg* Past 267

6.2.1 Trials, Not Summary Executions: Reversed Summary Vendetta? 267

6.2.2 Accountability for Heinous Crimes: Justice Redux. 269

6.2.3 Legal Legacy 270

References 272

7 Concluding Remarks 277

7.1 Recommendations. 281

Annexes 283

Index 301

Acronyms and Abbreviations

AESM	All-Ethiopian Socialist Movement
Am. J. Int'l L	American Journal of International Law
AU	African Union
B.U. INT'L L.J	Boston University International Law Journal
BYBIL	British Year Book of International Law
CELU	Confederation of Ethiopian Labor Unions
<i>Cf.</i>	Compare (<i>confer</i>)
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECOWAS	The Economic Community of Western African States
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ed(s).	Editor(s)
edn.	Edition
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
EPRDF	Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front
EPRP	Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Party
<i>et seq</i>	the following (<i>et sequens; et sequentes</i>)
FDRE	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
FHC	Federal High Court
FSC	Federal Supreme Court
HILJ	Harvard International Law Journal
i.e.	That is (<i>id est</i>)
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
ILR	International Law Reports
IMT	International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg
<i>Infra</i>	Below
JICJ	Journal of International Criminal Justice
MEISON	<i>Mela Ethiopia Socialist Niqinaqē</i>

p., pp.	Page, pages
PDRE	People’s Democratic Revolutionary Party
PDRE	Popular Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
PMAC	Provisional Military Administrative Council
POMOA	Provisional Office of Mass Organizational Affairs
SPP	Special Public Prosecutor
<i>Supra</i>	Above
TG	Transitional Government
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
WPE	Workers Party of Ethiopia