

International Criminal Justice Series

Volume 21

Series Editors

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Moritz Vormbaum, Münster, Germany

Series Information

The *International Criminal Justice Series* aims to create a platform for publications covering the entire field of international criminal justice. It, therefore, deals with issues relating, among others, to:

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars.

Editorial Office

Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Faculty of Law
Unter den Linden 6,
10099 Berlin, Germany
gerhard.werle@rewi.hu-berlin.de
vormbaum@uni-muenster.de

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/13470>

Seada Hussein Adem

Palestine and the International Criminal Court



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Seada Hussein Adem
Alexandria, VA, USA

ISSN 2352-6718 ISSN 2352-6726 (electronic)
International Criminal Justice Series
ISBN 978-94-6265-290-3 ISBN 978-94-6265-291-0 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-291-0>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2019931838

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2019

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE part of Springer Nature
The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

Acknowledgements

This study was conducted within the framework of the South African-German Centre for Transnational Criminal Justice. The Centre is the result of cooperation between Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin and the University of the Western Cape. It is supported by the *Deutscher Akademischer Austausch Dienst* (DAAD) with funds from the German Federal Foreign Office. I am thankful to the DAAD and the Federal Foreign Office for fully funding my work and stay in Berlin. The study would not have come to completion without their generous financial assistance.

I am deeply indebted to various people for the unfaltering support and contribution to bring this study to fruition. My foremost gratitude goes to Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle, my study supervisor and co-director of the Centre. Despite his busy schedule, he was able to follow my progress and give his constructive comments and constant support. I thank him not only for his excellent intellectual and academic guidance but also for being exemplary to me and many others. I am also thankful to the former co-director of the Centre Prof. Lovell Fernandez whose encouragement and support contributed greatly to the completion of the study and to the external examiner, Prof. Christian Tomuschat, whose invaluable comments considerably benefited the final draft of the study.

I am sincerely indebted to Prof. Moritz Vormbaum for his unreserved cooperation, encouragement and positive feedbacks. The work has benefited significantly from his insightful comments and tireless supervision. I also thank Prof. Chantal Meloni and Valentina Azarov for the kind material support and Dr. Boris Burghardt for editing part of the study.

I am also grateful to Anna Krey, the coordinator of the Centre, and Frau Anja Schepke as well as other members of the centre for their cooperation and invaluable administrative support throughout my stay in Berlin. I am particularly grateful to Frau Schepke who has managed all important matters pertaining to my stay in Berlin, such as university fees, health insurance, travel documents and accommodation.

Finally, yet importantly, I thank my parents, Hussein and Ansha Adem, my husband Ebrahim Kassie and my siblings Nuru and Semira Hussein whose constant prayer, support and encouragement kept me going. I also thank my friends and researchers in the Centre, Dr. Marshet Tadesse, Victoria Ojo, Marian Yankson-Mensah, Franziska Tolksdorf and Dr. Verena Zoppei. You made this journey memorable.

Above all, I say *Alhamdulillah* to the enabler, the bestower and the sustainer.

Contents

1	Introduction and Overview	1
1.1	Background	1
1.2	Objectives	4
1.3	Literature Survey	5
1.4	Limitation	7
1.5	Outline	8
	References	9
2	Historical and Political Background of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict	11
2.1	Introductory Remarks	12
2.2	The Origins of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict	12
2.2.1	Pre-Israel Palestine	13
2.2.2	Jewish Persecution and Zionism	14
2.2.3	The British, the Jews and the Palestinians	16
2.2.4	The Partition	19
2.3	Occupation and Resistance	21
2.3.1	The Arab-Israeli Wars	21
2.3.2	The Resistance: Guerrillas and Stones	24
2.4	The Occupied Palestinian Territories	28
2.4.1	Gaza	28
2.4.2	The West Bank	31
2.4.3	East Jerusalem	33
2.5	Military Operations and the UN Missions	35
2.5.1	Operation Cast Lead	35
2.5.2	Operation Protective Edge	37
2.6	Peace Negotiations	38
2.7	Chapter Summary	40
	References	41

3	The 2009 Palestinian <i>Ad hoc</i> Declaration	49
3.1	Introductory Remarks	50
3.2	The Legal Regime of <i>Ad hoc</i> Declarations	50
3.3	Decision of the Prosecutor on the 2009 Palestinian Declaration	54
3.4	Determination of Statehood for the Purpose of the ICC Jurisdiction	55
3.4.1	‘Kompetenz-Kompetenz’	57
3.4.2	Possible Avenues to Determine the Statehood Issue	58
3.5	The Palestine Statehood Issue	62
3.5.1	The Statehood of Palestine: General Considerations	62
3.5.1.1	Palestine’s Declaration of Statehood	62
3.5.1.2	The Montevideo Convention	64
3.5.1.3	Theories of State Recognition	67
3.5.1.4	Palestine as an Occupied Territory	69
3.5.1.5	Conclusion on the Abstract Statehood of Palestine	69
3.5.2	The Functional Approach: Statehood for the Purposes of <i>Ad hoc</i> Declarations	70
3.6	Subsequent Developments	75
3.7	Chapter Summary	75
	References	76
4	Pre-Investigation Considerations	79
4.1	Introductory Remarks	80
4.2	Preliminary Examination: An Overview	81
4.3	Jurisdiction	84
4.3.1	Ratione temporis	84
4.3.2	Ratione materiae	88
4.3.3	Ratione loci or personae	90
4.4	Admissibility	91
4.4.1	Complementarity	92
4.4.1.1	Israel’s Accountability Mechanism	94
4.4.1.2	Palestine’s Accountability Mechanism	97
4.4.2	Gravity	98
4.5	The ‘Interest of Justice’ Consideration	100
4.6	Governing Principles	103
4.7	Chapter Summary	106
	References	107

5	Case Selection and Crimes Under the Rome Statute	111
5.1	Introductory Remarks	112
5.2	Strategy for Case Selection	112
5.2.1	Legal Criteria	114
5.2.1.1	Determination of the ‘Reasonable Basis to Proceed’ Standard	115
5.2.1.2	Determination of the ‘Sufficient Basis’ Standard	116
5.2.2	Selection of Cases	116
5.2.2.1	Gravity as a Criterion for Case Selection	117
5.2.2.2	Degree of Responsibility of Alleged Perpetrators	118
5.2.2.3	Charges	120
5.3	Potential Cases Under the Rome Statute	121
5.3.1	Cases of War Crime	122
5.3.1.1	Attacks on Civilians and Civilian Objects	133
5.3.1.2	Use of Human Shields	141
5.3.1.3	Settlements	143
5.3.1.4	Wilful killing	146
5.3.2	Cases of Crimes against Humanity	148
5.3.2.1	Forcible Transfer of Population	151
5.3.2.2	The Crime of Apartheid	154
5.3.2.3	Persecution	172
5.4	Chapter Summary	177
	References	178
6	Perspectives on the Intervention of the ICC in Palestine	187
6.1	Introductory Remarks	188
6.2	Possible Impacts of the ICC’s Intervention in the Palestine Situation	190
6.2.1	Combating Impunity	190
6.2.1.1	Individualising Guilt and Challenging Narratives	191
6.2.1.2	Responding to the Needs of Victims	192
6.2.1.3	Deterrence and Retribution	194
6.2.1.4	Promoting National Judicial Reforms	197
6.2.2	Fostering Palestine’s Statehood	199
6.2.3	Peace Negotiations	201
6.2.3.1	Promoting Peace Negotiations	201
6.2.3.2	Hindering Peace Negotiations	203
6.2.4	Stabilising the States	205
6.2.5	Promoting the Credibility of the Court	207

6.3	Alternative and Parallel Options to the ICC	210
6.3.1	Prosecutions Through Universal Jurisdiction	211
6.3.2	A Special Tribunal	213
6.3.3	Non-judicial Measures	214
6.4	Chapter Summary	215
	References	215
7	Conclusions and Recommendations	221
7.1	General Remarks	221
7.2	Conclusions	221
7.3	Recommendations	225
Index	227

Abbreviations and Acronyms

AC	Appeals Chamber
ASP	Assembly of States Parties (of the ICC)
AU	African Union
CAR	Central African Republic
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
ESCWA	United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia
FIDH	International Federation for Human Rights
HSRC	Human Sciences Research Council of South Africa
IAEA	International Atomic Energy Agency
ICAHD	Israeli Committee Against House Demolitions
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IDF	Israeli Defence Force
ILC	International Law Commission
JICJ	Journal of International Criminal Justice
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
OPT	Occupied Palestinian Territories
OTP	Office of the Prosecutor (of the ICC)
PA	Palestinian Authority
PLO	Palestine Liberation Organization
PTC	Pre-Trial Chamber (of the ICC)
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission (of South Africa)
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNHRC	United Nations Human Rights Council
UNOCHA	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
UNOCHA-OPT	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs—Occupied Palestinian Territory
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSCOP	United Nations Special Committee on Palestine
WTO	World Trade Organisation