

# **European Yearbook of Constitutional Law**

Volume 1

The *European Yearbook of Constitutional Law* (EYCL) is an annual publication devoted to the study of constitutional law. The yearbook provides a forum for in-depth analysis and discussion of new developments in constitutional law in Europe and beyond. Each issue is dedicated to a specific theme. Papers are subject to editorial and double-blind peer review. The yearbook is published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS in cooperation with Springer Publishers.

**Contact**

To get in touch, please send an e-mail to [eycl@tilburguniversity.edu](mailto:eycl@tilburguniversity.edu)

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/16431>

Ernst Hirsch Ballin · Gerhard van der Schyff ·  
Maarten Stremmer  
Editors

# European Yearbook of Constitutional Law 2019

Judicial Power: Safeguards and Limits  
in a Democratic Society



ASSER PRESS



Springer

*Editors*

Ernst Hirsch Ballin  
Tilburg University  
Tilburg, The Netherlands

Gerhard van der Schyff  
Tilburg University  
Tilburg, The Netherlands

and

University of Amsterdam  
Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Maarten Stremmer  
Tilburg University  
Tilburg, The Netherlands

The views expressed in this *Yearbook* are not necessarily those of the members of the Editorial Board, the Board of Recommendation and/or those institutions they represent, including the T.M.C. Asser Instituut and T.M.C. ASSER PRESS.

ISSN 2405-6111

ISSN 2405-612X (electronic)

European Yearbook of Constitutional Law

ISBN 978-94-6265-358-0

ISBN 978-94-6265-359-7 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-359-7>

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands [www.asserpress.nl](http://www.asserpress.nl)

Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2020

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

## **Editorial Board**

### *Series Editors*

Prof. dr. Ernst M. H. Hirsch Ballin (*Editor*), Tilburg University/University of  
Amsterdam

Dr. Gerhard van der Schyff (*Editor*), Tilburg University  
Dr. Maartje de Visser (*Editor*), Singapore Management University

### *Managing Editor*

Maarten Stremmer LLM, Tilburg University

## **Board of Recommendation**

Prof. dr. Armin von Bogdandy, Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law  
and International Law

Prof. em. dr. Marc Bossuyt, University of Antwerp

Prof. dr. Alfonso Celotto, Roma Tre University

Prof. dr. Janneke Gerards, Utrecht University

Prof. dr. Daniel Halberstam, University of Michigan

# Preface

This is the inaugural issue of the *European Yearbook of Constitutional Law* (EYCL), an annual publication that will be devoted to the study of constitutional law. It aims to provide a forum for in-depth analysis and discussion of new developments in the field, both in Europe and beyond. Each issue will be dedicated to a specific theme.

While a number of journals cover the topic of constitutional law, there has until now been no *yearbook* dedicated to the study of the discipline. The benefit of a yearbook is that it can be devoted to specific themes, with a different aspect of the field being covered each year. Although this is also possible in journals, some journals avoid ‘special issues’, whereas others allow such issues, but remain focused on publishing series of mostly unrelated articles.

The theme of the present volume is ‘Judicial Power: Safeguards and Limits in a Democratic Society’, while the next volume will concentrate on ‘The City in Constitutional Law’. We are grateful to T.M.C. Asser Press and Springer for their support in publishing this yearbook, to Tilburg Law School for its commitment to bringing this project to fruition, and to the authors and anonymous reviewers of this year’s volume.

Tilburg, The Netherlands

Ernst Hirsch Ballin  
Gerhard van der Schyff  
Maarten Stremler

# Contents

## Part I

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction: Safeguards and Limits of Judicial Power</b> .....	<b>3</b>
	Ernst Hirsch Ballin, Gerhard van der Schyff and Maarten Stremmer	
<b>2</b>	<b>The Independence of the Belgian Constitutional Court</b> .....	<b>13</b>
	Evelyne Maes	
<b>3</b>	<b>Judicial Independence and Democratic Accountability: The Function and Legitimacy of the German Federal Constitutional Court</b> .....	<b>41</b>
	Anja Seibert-Fohr	
<b>4</b>	<b>Italy and Its Constitutional Court</b> .....	<b>67</b>
	Alfonso Celotto	
<b>5</b>	<b>Bipolar Constitutionalism in The Netherlands and Its Consequences for the Independence and Accountability of the Judiciary</b> .....	<b>97</b>
	Geerten Boogaard	
<b>6</b>	<b>‘... destroy all sense of dependence’: On the Selection and Independence of the Judiciary in Norway</b> .....	<b>121</b>
	Eivind Smith	
<b>7</b>	<b>Judicial Independence and Accountability in the British Constitution</b> .....	<b>143</b>
	Paul Daly	
<b>8</b>	<b>Independence and Accountability of the South African Judiciary</b> .....	<b>171</b>
	Francois Venter	

<b>9</b>	<b>Judicial Independence and Accountability in the Council of Europe and the European Court of Human Rights</b> .....	197
	Jörg Luther	
<b>10</b>	<b>Accountability Through Transparency and the Role of the Court of Justice of the European Union</b> .....	221
	Marios Costa	
<b>11</b>	<b>The Last Soldier Standing? Courts Versus Politicians and the Rule of Law Crisis in the New Member States of the EU</b> .....	243
	Dimitry Kochenov and Petra Bárd	
<b>12</b>	<b>A Stress Test for Europe’s Judiciaries</b> .....	289
	Eirik Holmøyvik and Anne Sanders	
<b>Part II Comments and Opinions</b>		
<b>13</b>	<b>The Strasbourg Court: Judges Without Borders</b> .....	315
	Marc Bossuyt	
<b>14</b>	<b>The Strasbourg Court: Acting Within Its Limits</b> .....	325
	Egbert Myjer	



# Editors and Contributors

## About the Editors

**Ernst Hirsch Ballin** is Distinguished University Professor at Tilburg University and Professor of Human Rights Law at the University of Amsterdam. He is the president of the Asser Institute for International and European Law and a Member of the Royal Netherlands Academy of Sciences. Previously, he has served as deputy justice in the Appellate Court for the Public Service and Social Security Law, as judge and President of the Judicial Division of the Council of State and as the Minister of Justice of the Kingdom of the Netherlands. His current research focusses on Dutch and transnational constitutional law, migration and citizenship, and legal research methods.

**Gerhard van der Schyff** is Associate Professor in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg University in the Netherlands. He lectures and conducts research on constitutional law and fundamental rights in comparative and European perspective. In 2015, he held a Humboldt Fellowship for Experienced Researchers at the Chair of Christian Calliess at the Free University in Berlin, dealing with the topic of constitutional identity.

**Maarten Stremmer** is Researcher and Lecturer in Constitutional Law in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg Law School and a guest staff member in the Department of Constitutional and Administrative Law at Leiden Law School. His primary research interests are constitutional law and constitutional theory. He is writing a Ph.D. thesis on constitutional oversight by the European Union. He is co-author of *Constitutional Preambles: A Comparative Analysis* (Edward Elgar, 2016).

## Contributors\*

**Geerten Boogaard** Leiden University, Leiden, The Netherlands

**Marc Bossuyt** University of Antwerp, Antwerp, Belgium

**Petra Bárd** Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest, Hungary;  
Legal Studies Department, Central European University, Budapest, Hungary

**Alfonso Celotto** ‘Roma Tre’ University, Rome, Italy

**Marios Costa** City, University of London, London, UK

**Paul Daly** University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK

**Ernst Hirsch Ballin** Tilburg University, Tilburg, The Netherlands;  
University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

**Eirik Holmøyvik** University of Bergen, Bergen, Norway

**Dimitry Kochenov** University of Groningen, Groningen, The Netherlands

**Jörg Luther** University of Eastern Piedmont Amedeo Avogadro, Alessandria,  
Italy

**Evelyne Maes** Saint-Louis University, Brussels, Belgium

**Egbert Myjer** Leiden, The Netherlands

**Anne Sanders** University of Bielefeld, Bielefeld, Germany

**Anja Seibert-Fohr** University of Heidelberg, Heidelberg, Germany

**Eivind Smith** University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway

**Maarten Stremmer** Tilburg University, Tilburg, The Netherlands

**Gerhard van der Schyff** Tilburg University, Tilburg, The Netherlands

**Francois Venter** North-West University, Potchefstroom, South Africa

---

\*The full information on each contributor is included at the end of the chapter they contributed to.