

International Criminal Justice Series

Volume 29

Series Editors

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Moritz Vormbaum, Münster, Germany

Series Information

The *International Criminal Justice Series* aims to create a platform for publications covering the entire field of international criminal justice. It, therefore, deals with issues relating, among others, to:

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars.

Editorial Office

Prof. Dr. Moritz Vormbaum
University of Münster
Faculty of Law
Bispinghof 24-25
48143 Münster, Germany
vormbaum@uni-muenster.de

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/13470>

Tanja Altunjan

Reproductive Violence and International Criminal Law



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Acknowledgements

This book is based on a dissertation which was defended at Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin on 14 July 2020. First and foremost, I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle for supervising this work and creating the perfect research environment at his Chair at Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin. Prof. Werle's guidance and support made this project possible in the first place. Secondly, I want to thank Prof. Dr. Martin Heger and Prof. Dr. Florian Jeßberger for their helpful feedback and encouragement. I am also grateful to the Studienstiftung des deutschen Volkes e.V. for funding the research which led to this book.

I would like to thank my wonderful colleagues at Lehrstuhl Werle: Dr. Leonie Steinl, LL.M., Dr. Aziz Epik, LL.M., and Dr. Yao Li for their input, encouragement, and friendship throughout the years; Merle Iffert and Lisa Marie von Mansberg for being the first and last reader, respectively; Anja Schepke for her endless patience and support; and most importantly Nella Sayatz for being the best office companion and friend I could have asked for.

Finally, I thank Jenny, Philipp, Sandra, and Dominika as well as Annemarie and Katharina for their unwavering support through this and everything else, and Alexander for standing beside me every step of the way. Most importantly, I want to thank my parents, Stefanie and Eric. This book is for them, because they made it (and everything else) possible.

Contents

1 Introduction	1
1.1 Aim and Impetus of This Book	1
1.2 Structure	4
1.3 Terminology	5
1.3.1 Sex and Gender	5
1.3.2 Sexualized and Gender-Based Violence	7
1.3.3 Reproductive Violence	9
1.4 Theoretical and Methodological Background	11
1.4.1 International Criminal Law in the International Legal Order	11
1.4.2 Sources and Interpretation of International Criminal Law	14
1.4.3 Feminist Approaches to International Law	15
References	16
2 The Foundation: Sexualized Violence in International Law	21
2.1 Introduction	22
2.2 The Factual Background: Conflict-Related Sexualized Violence	22
2.2.1 Manifestations of Sexualized Violence in Conflict Situations	24
2.2.2 Effects of Conflict-Related Sexualized Violence	26
2.2.3 Causes of Conflict-Related Sexualized Violence	27
2.2.4 Narratives of Conflict-Related Sexualized Violence	31
2.2.5 Summary	34
2.3 International Humanitarian Law	35
2.3.1 Early Developments	35
2.3.2 The Hague and Geneva Conventions	37
2.3.3 Sexualized Violence and the Concept of “Honour” in International Humanitarian Law	39
2.3.4 Summary	40

- 2.4 International Criminal Law 40
 - 2.4.1 Before World War II 41
 - 2.4.2 Trials Post-World War II 41
 - 2.4.3 The Cold War Period and Beyond 45
 - 2.4.4 Statutes and Practice of the *ad hoc* Tribunals 50
 - 2.4.5 The International Criminal Court 54
 - 2.4.6 Other International and Hybrid Courts 60
 - 2.4.7 Summary 63
- 2.5 International Human Rights Law 63
 - 2.5.1 Human Rights Instruments Focusing on the Protection
of Women 64
 - 2.5.2 Soft Law on Sexualized Violence 65
- 2.6 Conclusion 67
- References 67
- 3 Historical Perspectives on Reproductive Violence
in International Law 77**
 - 3.1 Introduction 78
 - 3.2 The Factual Background: Conflict-Related Reproductive
Violence 78
 - 3.2.1 Historical Overview on Reproductive Violence
in Conflict Situations 78
 - 3.2.2 Reproductive Violence and Children Born of Rape
in Conflicts 92
 - 3.2.3 Manifestations and Effects of Conflict-Related
Reproductive Violence 95
 - 3.2.4 Summary 96
 - 3.3 International Criminal Law 97
 - 3.3.1 The Concept of Reproductive Violence in International
Criminal Law 97
 - 3.3.2 Reproductive Violence in Post-World War II Trials 99
 - 3.3.3 Reproductive Violence in the Genocide Convention 106
 - 3.3.4 Reproductive Violence in the Statutes and Practice
of Modern International and Hybrid Criminal Courts 107
 - 3.3.5 Reproductive Violence in Legal Scholarship 112
 - 3.3.6 Summary 119
 - 3.4 International Human Rights Law 119
 - 3.4.1 Reproductive Rights as Internationally Recognized
Human Rights 120
 - 3.4.2 Reproductive Violence as a Human Rights Violation 127
 - 3.5 Conclusion 129
 - References 129

- 4 Reproductive Violence and Genocide** 137
 - 4.1 Introduction 138
 - 4.2 Pregnancy-Related Crimes as Genocide: Historical and Conceptual Background 138
 - 4.2.1 The Impetus: Reports from the Former Yugoslavia 139
 - 4.2.2 Rape as an Act of Genocide 148
 - 4.2.3 The Genocidal Nature of Pregnancy-Related Crimes: A “Logical Glitch”? 150
 - 4.2.4 Genocide and Children Born of Rape 152
 - 4.2.5 Summary and Evaluation 155
 - 4.3 The Prosecution of Pregnancy-Related Crimes as Genocide 156
 - 4.3.1 Preliminary Remarks 157
 - 4.3.2 Causing Serious Bodily or Mental Harm to Members of the Group 161
 - 4.3.3 Deliberately Inflicting on the Group Conditions of Life Calculated to Bring About Its Physical Destruction in Whole or in Part 162
 - 4.3.4 Imposing Measures Intended to Prevent Births Within the Group 164
 - 4.3.5 Forcibly Transferring Children of the Group to Another Group 170
 - 4.3.6 The Intent to Destroy 173
 - 4.3.7 Summary 176
 - 4.4 Other Forms of Reproductive Violence as Genocide 176
 - 4.4.1 Forced Sterilization 177
 - 4.4.2 Forced Abortion 180
 - 4.4.3 Forced Contraception 181
 - 4.4.4 Summary 182
 - 4.5 Conclusion 183
 - References 183
- 5 Forced Pregnancy as a Crime Against Humanity and a War Crime** 187
 - 5.1 Introduction 188
 - 5.2 Historical and Conceptual Background 189
 - 5.2.1 Preliminary Remarks on Terminology Regarding Pregnancy-Related Crimes 189
 - 5.2.2 The Impetus 191
 - 5.2.3 Forced Pregnancy in the Human Rights Discourse 194
 - 5.3 The Negotiations for the Statute of the International Criminal Court 196
 - 5.3.1 Early Developments 196
 - 5.3.2 Preparatory Committee 197
 - 5.3.3 Rome Conference 1998 200
 - 5.3.4 Preparatory Commission 205

5.3.5	Analysis and Evaluation of the Drafting Process	207
5.4	Forced Pregnancy as a Separate Crime Under International Law	210
5.4.1	Implicit Prosecution as Other Crimes	210
5.4.2	Necessity of Separate Crimes?	212
5.4.3	Analysis	216
5.5	The Definition of Forced Pregnancy in the ICC Statute	220
5.5.1	Protected Value	220
5.5.2	Preliminary Remarks on the Elements of the Crime	224
5.5.3	Woman Forcibly Made Pregnant	225
5.5.4	Unlawful Confinement	231
5.5.5	General Intent, Article 30 of the ICC Statute	237
5.5.6	Special Intent, Article 7(2)(f) of the ICC Statute	238
5.5.7	No Effect on National Laws Relating to Pregnancy	244
5.5.8	Proposals <i>De Lege Ferenda</i>	251
5.6	Forced Pregnancy Beyond the ICC	255
5.6.1	Forced Pregnancy in Other Jurisdictions	255
5.6.2	Forced Pregnancy as a Crime Under Customary International Law	257
5.7	Conclusion	259
	References	260
6	Enforced Sterilization and Other Forms of Reproductive Violence as Crimes Against Humanity and War Crimes	271
6.1	Introduction	272
6.2	The Crime of Enforced Sterilization	272
6.2.1	Historical Background	272
6.2.2	Elements of the Crime of Enforced Sterilization	275
6.2.3	Practice	277
6.2.4	Summary	278
6.3	“Unnamed” Reproductive Crimes: Implicit Prosecution of Reproductive Violence	278
6.3.1	The Categorization of Reproductive Violence as “Any Other Form of Sexual Violence”?	279
6.3.2	Persecution on the Grounds of Gender	286
6.3.3	Necessity of Separate Reproductive Crimes?	286
6.3.4	Summary	288
6.4	Conclusion	288
	References	289
7	Conclusion	293
	Index	297