

International Criminal Justice Series

Volume 30

Series Editors

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Moritz Vormbaum, Münster, Germany

The *International Criminal Justice Series* aims to create a platform for publications covering the entire field of international criminal justice. It, therefore, deals with issues relating, among others, to:

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars.

Editorial Office

Prof. Dr. Moritz Vormbaum
University of Münster
Faculty of Law
Bispinghof 24-25
48143 Münster, Germany
vormbaum@uni-muenster.de

More information about this series at <https://link.springer.com/bookseries/13470>

Valérie V. Suhr

Rainbow Jurisdiction at the International Criminal Court

Protection of Sexual and Gender Minorities
Under the Rome Statute



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Valérie V. Suhr
Glückstadt, Germany

ISSN 2352-6718 ISSN 2352-6726 (electronic)
International Criminal Justice Series
ISBN 978-94-6265-482-2 ISBN 978-94-6265-483-9 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-483-9>

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2022

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

To my father, Jörg W. Suhr.

Acknowledgements

This book is based on my Ph.D. thesis “Protection of Sexual and Gender Minorities through International Criminal Law.” It was defended on 28 October 2020, attaining *summa cum laude* at the Faculty of Law of the University of Hamburg in Germany.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor Prof. Dr. Nora Markard, MA (London). She has supported me in every possible way. From the very first, the idea of writing a Ph.D., to completing the published book, she always inspired me. I am truly grateful for her support. I would also like to thank my second supervisor, Prof. Dr. Milan Kuhli, for his prompt evaluation.

I would like to thank the German Academic Scholarship Foundation (Studienstiftung des deutschen Volkes) for the generous Ph.D. fellowship, which allowed me to focus on my Ph.D., conduct research abroad and through which I got to meet wonderful people.

I am grateful for the opportunity to conduct research and to meet inspiring people at various international research institutions: the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law (University of Cambridge), the University of Michigan Law School, the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies (Leiden University) and the Irish Centre for Human Rights (National University of Ireland, Galway). Especially, I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Catharine A. MacKinnon, the former special gender advisor to the ICC, who allowed me to sit in on her class “Sex Equality” in Michigan. I am thankful for her feedback on the first drafts of my thesis. I would also like to thank Prof. Andrea K. Bjorklund for giving me the opportunity to present my thesis at the McGill Faculty of Law, Montreal.

For the regular discussions and support on all topics concerning the Ph.D., I would like to thank my friends Dr. Dana-Sophia Valentiner, Sarah Leyli Rödiger and Annegret Hartig. I would also like to thank my other friends, especially Katharina Brinkmann, Monica Benthin, Katharina Hesse and Annkathrin Mertz, for all the times we have spent together.

My very special thanks go to Dr. Kirstin Ursula Willy, on whose support I could always rely, not only regarding the dissertation and the present book, but in every respect. She encourages and inspires me in so many ways.

Most importantly, I would like to thank my loving family from the bottom of my heart for always being there for me: my mother Andrea Suhr, my grandmother Rosemarie Suhr, my sister Julia C. Suhr, my niece Leia C. Suhr and my grandparents Renate and Heinz Mahn. They made everything possible.

Glückstadt, Germany
August 2021

Valérie V. Suhr

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Introductory Remarks	2
1.2	Practical Importance of the Book	4
1.3	Scope of the Analysis	8
1.4	Methodology	12
1.5	Definitions	15
1.5.1	Gender-Based Crimes	15
1.5.2	LGBTI as Well as Sexual and Gender Minorities	15
1.5.3	Sexual Orientation and Sexual Minorities	17
1.5.4	Gender Identity and Gender Minorities	18
1.6	Course of the Argument	21
	References	22
 Part I Factual and Legal Background		
2	Reality	33
2.1	Introduction	34
2.2	Lack of Data	35
2.3	Perpetrators	36
2.4	Differences Between Persecution of Female and Male Sexual Minorities	36
2.5	Case Groups	38
2.5.1	Anti-SGM Laws	38
2.5.2	Crimes Committed by the Police	42
2.5.3	Crimes Committed in Prisons, Detentions Centers, and Custody	44
2.5.4	Human Rights Defenders and Activists	45
2.5.5	Correction Centers and Therapies	46
2.5.6	Genital Surgeries on Intersex Children	47
2.6	Conclusion	48
	References	49

3	Interpretation of the Rome Statute	53
3.1	Introductory Remarks	54
3.2	The ICC's Applicable Law	55
3.3	Rules of Interpretation According to the Vienna Convention	57
3.3.1	General Rule of Interpretation	57
3.3.2	Supplementary Means of Interpretation	64
3.4	<i>Nullum Crimen</i> Principle	66
3.4.1	Purposes of the Principle of Legality	68
3.4.2	Elements of the <i>Nullum Crimen</i> Principle	69
3.4.3	Temporal Element of Interpretation	73
3.5	Human Rights Interpretation Including the Principle of Non-Discrimination	74
3.5.1	Relationship Between International Criminal Law and International Human Rights Law	75
3.5.2	Human Rights Interpretation	81
3.5.3	The Universal and the Regional Human Rights Systems	92
3.5.4	Internationally Recognized Human Rights	105
3.5.5	Prohibition on Adverse Distinction	116
3.6	Conclusion	118
	References	118

Part II Persecution of Sexual and Gender Minorities as a Crime Against Humanity

4	Contextual Element	131
4.1	Introductory Remarks	132
4.2	Widespread or Systematic Attack Directed Against Any Civilian Population	133
4.2.1	Widespread or Systematic Attack	134
4.2.2	Policy Element	137
4.2.3	Directed Against Any Civilian Population	145
4.3	Connection with the Individual Act	146
4.4	Mental Elements	148
4.5	Conclusion	149
	References	149
5	The Crime Against Humanity of Persecution	153
5.1	Introductory Remarks	154
5.2	Persecutory Acts, Severe Deprivation of Fundamental Rights, and Connection to Another Crime	156
5.2.1	Criminalization of Same-Sex Sexuality	158
5.2.2	Concentration Camps	167
5.2.3	Extra-Legal Arbitrary Arrests	169
5.2.4	Killings and Violence by Non-State Actors and Extra-Legally Acting State Officials	170

- 5.2.5 Torture and Other Ill-Treatment 172
- 5.2.6 Restrictions on the Freedoms of Opinion
and Expression, Association, and Assembly 181
- 5.2.7 Restrictions of Family and Partnership Rights 186
- 5.2.8 Summary 190
- 5.3 Persecution against Any Identifiable Group or Collectivity
on Various Grounds 191
 - 5.3.1 Links between International Criminal Law
Persecution, International Refugee Law
Persecution, and International Human Rights Law
Discrimination 192
 - 5.3.2 “Any” Identifiable Group or Collectivity Versus
Only Qualified Groups or Collectivities 193
 - 5.3.3 Subjective or Objective Determination
of the Group or Collectivity 196
 - 5.3.4 Summary 199
- References 200
- 6 Gender-Based Persecution of Sexual and Gender Minorities 209**
 - 6.1 Introductory Remarks 210
 - 6.2 The Drafting History 215
 - 6.3 The *Nullum Crimen* Principle 221
 - 6.4 The Definition: The Two Sexes Within the Context
of Society 222
 - 6.4.1 “The Two Sexes” 223
 - 6.4.2 “Within the Context of Society”: Gender
as a Social Construct 225
 - 6.4.3 SGM Persecutions as Gender Persecutions 231
 - 6.4.4 Gender-Based Persecution of Sexual Minorities 243
 - 6.4.5 Gender-Based Persecution of Gender Minorities 246
 - 6.4.6 Summary 251
 - 6.5 Human Rights Interpretation 252
 - 6.5.1 Rights of Sexual and Gender Minorities
as “Internationally Recognized Human Rights” 253
 - 6.5.2 The Rome Statute’s No-Adverse Distinction
Clause Includes Sexual Orientation and Gender
Identity 254
 - 6.5.3 Meaning for SGM Rights for the Crime
of Gender-Based Persecution 259
 - 6.5.4 International Law’s Understanding of Gender 260
 - 6.5.5 Summary 260
 - 6.6 Conclusion 261
 - References 262

7 Persecution on “Other Grounds that Are Universally Recognized as Impermissible Under International Law” 275

7.1 Introductory Remarks 276

7.2 Universalism Versus Cultural Relativism, Colonialism, and Anti-SGM Laws 278

7.2.1 Affirmation and Challenges to Human Rights’ Universality at the International Level 279

7.2.2 Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity as Apparently Culturally Sensitive Issues 282

7.2.3 Summary 286

7.3 How to Define the “Other Grounds that Are Universally Recognized as Impermissible Under International Law” 287

7.3.1 *Jus Cogens* 288

7.3.2 Customary International Law 289

7.3.3 Human Rights Treaty Law and International Interpretation 291

7.3.4 Summary 295

7.4 Human Rights of Sexual and Gender Minorities 296

7.4.1 The Principles of Equality and Non-Discrimination Under International Human Rights Law 297

7.4.2 International Refugee Law 314

7.5 Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity as “Other Grounds that Are Universally Recognized as Impermissible Under International Law” 316

7.6 Conclusion 319

References 319

8 Political Persecution of Human Rights Defenders and Activists 333

References 335

9 Key Findings of Part II 337

Part III Anti-SGM Legislating as a Crime Against Humanity

10 Anti-SGM Legislating as a Crime Against Humanity 343

10.1 Introductory Remarks 344

10.2 Existing Cases 347

10.3 Modes of Individual Criminal Responsibility for Legislation 349

10.3.1 Individual Criminal Responsibility for Legislating When the Anti-SGM Law Is Enforced 349

10.3.2 Unenforced Anti-SGM Laws as Attempts 376

10.4 Conclusion 379

References 379

Part IV Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations

11 Summary, Factual Consequences, and Recommendations 387

 11.1 Introductory Remarks 388

 11.2 Summary 388

 11.3 Factual Consequences of Viewing Persecution of SGM
 as a Crime Against Humanity 391

 11.4 Recommendations 392

 References 395

Index 397

Abbreviations

AC	Appeals Chamber
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACmHPR	African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACtHPR	African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights
AHRD	ASEAN Human Rights Declaration
ArCHR	Revised Arab Charter on Human Rights
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
AU	African Union
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECmHR	European Commission of Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
Fn	Footnote
GC	Grand Chamber
IACmHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice

ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ILC	International Law Commission
ISIS	Islamic State of Iraq and Syria
LGBTI	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans, Intersex
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
OAS	Organization of American States
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
PTC	Pre-trial Chamber
Rome Statute	Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
SGM	Sexual and Gender Minorities
TC	Trial Chamber
UDHR	Universal Declaration on Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNHCHR	United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties