

International Criminal Justice Series

Volume 31

Series Editors

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Moritz Vormbaum, Münster, Germany

The *International Criminal Justice Series* aims to create a platform for publications covering the entire field of international criminal justice. It, therefore, deals with issues relating, among others, to:

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars.

Editorial Office

Prof. Dr. Moritz Vormbaum
University of Münster
Faculty of Law
Bispinghof 24-25
48143 Münster, Germany
vormbaum@uni-muenster.de

Florian Jeßberger · Leonie Steinl · Kalika Mehta
Editors

International Criminal Law—A Counter-Hegemonic Project?



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Editors

Florian Jeßberger
Juristische Fakultät
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Berlin, Germany

Leonie Steinl
Juristische Fakultät
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Berlin, Germany

Kalika Mehta
Juristische Fakultät
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Berlin, Germany

ISSN 2352-6718

ISSN 2352-6726 (electronic)

International Criminal Justice Series

ISBN 978-94-6265-550-8

ISBN 978-94-6265-551-5 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-551-5>

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl

Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2023

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE, part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

Preface

This volume brings together various perspectives on the counter-hegemonic potential of international criminal justice. It is in part based on a conference which was hosted by Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin's Franz von Liszt Institute for International Criminal Justice and took place online in June 2021.

The contributions to the conference were chosen from an open call for papers. Several of the papers presented at the conference were selected for publication in this edited volume which also contains a number of additional contributions solicited in order to complement the issues addressed in this book. The call for papers particularly encouraged scholars and practitioners from the Global South¹ as well as early career scholars to submit an abstract.

The collection attempts to highlight these perspectives as well as themes that have thus far received little to no attention in the scholarship on (critical approaches to) international criminal justice. This includes *inter alia* the engagement with international criminal justice in Ukraine or minorities in South Asia but also the hegemonic tendencies built into the institutional structure of the International Criminal Court. To this extent, this volume also mirrors what scholars, in particular younger scholars as well as practitioners from the Global South, deem topical issues of a critical scholarship in international criminal justice.

We express our gratitude to those who have made this volume and the earlier held conference possible. *Claudia Cardenas Aravena* (Santiago de Chile), *Valeria Vegh Weis* (Buenos Aires, Konstanz), *Stefan Gosepath* (Berlin), *John-Mark Iyi* (Cape

¹ We acknowledge that the term Global South in so far as it suggests a geographical North–South binary is problematic. In the call for papers, we, therefore, highlighted that we understood it to also include “spaces in the North that are characterized by exploitation, oppression and neocolonial relations, such as indigenous and black communities (and immigrant communities) in Western societies”, see Sajed A 2020, *E-International Relations, From the Third World to the Global South*, <https://www.e-ir.info/2020/07/27/from-the-third-world-to-the-global-south/>. Accessed May 18, 2022. Our selection criteria considered the place of contributor's first university degree, instead of exclusively relying on their current affiliation, as a key indicator among other factors. However, we do recognize the inherent limitations of such a process and that it is not our place to ascribe the label of “Global South scholar or practitioner” to others.

Town), *Miles Jackson* (Oxford) and *Wolfgang Kaleck* (Berlin) formed part of a working group which advised us on the shaping of our research agenda and the selection of papers. *Claudia* and *Miles* also chaired a session while *Valeria* and *John-Mark* contributed chapters to this volume.

We are indebted to *Luca Hauffe* who provided invaluable support in the compilation of this volume and was instrumental in the coordination and organization of the conference. *Sarah Imani* advised us on issues of Islamic law. *Antonia Gillhaus* and *Antonia Vehrkamp* helped with the copy editing of the manuscript.

We are also grateful to the Berlin Center for Global Engagement in the Berlin University Alliance, for funding a larger research project, led by *Stefan Gosepath* and *Florian Jeßberger*, of which this volume and the aforementioned conference form part.

Berlin, Germany
January 2022

Florian Jeßberger
Leonie Steinel
Kalika Mehta

Contents

1	Hegemony and International Criminal Law—An Introduction	1
	Florian Jeßberger, Leonie Steinl and Kalika Mehta	
	Part I Theoretical Engagements with (Counter-) Hegemonic Perspectives on International Criminal Law	
2	Is International Criminal Justice the Handmaiden of the Contemporary Imperial Project? A TWAIL Perspective on Some Arenas of Contestations	13
	John-Mark Iyi	
3	Violence in International Criminal Law and Beyond	39
	Anastasiya Kotova	
4	A Marxist Analysis of International Criminal Law and Its Potential as a Counter-Hegemonic Project	63
	Valeria Vegh Weis	
	Part II (Counter-) Hegemonic International Criminal Law in Practice: Case Studies	
5	Double Whammy: Targeted Minorities in South-Asian States	87
	Ishita Chakrabarty and Guneet Kaur	
6	States of Criminality: International (Criminal) Law, Palestine, and the Sovereignty Trap	111
	Michelle Burgis-Kasthala, Nahed Samour and Christine Schwöbel-Patel	
7	The Counter-Hegemonic Turn to ‘Entrepreneurial Justice’ in International Criminal Investigations and Prosecutions Relating to the Crimes Committed in Syria and Eastern Ukraine	135
	Karolina Aksamitowska	

**8 NGOs and the Legitimacy of International Criminal Justice:
The Case of Uganda 153**
Tonny Raymond Kirabira

**Part III (Counter-) Hegemony at the International Criminal
Court**

**9 The Global South and the Drafting of the Subject-Matter
Jurisdiction of the ICC 177**
Taxiarchis Fiskatoris

**10 The ICC and Traditional Islamic Legal Scholarship:
Analysing the War Crimes Against Civilians 191**
Fajri Matahati Muhammadin and Ahmad Sadzali

**11 The ICC’s Role in Countering Patriarchal Claims
in Reproductive Justice 215**
Angie K. García Atehortúa

12 The Impacts of English-Language Hegemony on the ICC 239
Leigh Swigart

**13 Gender Imbalance at the ICC: The Continued Hegemonic
Entrenchment of Male Privilege in International Criminal Law ... 265**
Angela Mudukuti

Editors and Contributors

About the Editors

Florian Jeßberger is a Professor of Law at Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Germany, where he holds the Chair in Criminal Law, Criminal Procedure, International Criminal Law, and Modern Legal History and serves as Director of the Franz von Liszt Institute for International Criminal Justice. His research centers on international and comparative criminal law and modern legal history.

Leonie Steinl is a Postdoctoral Researcher and Lecturer in Law at Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Germany, and Member of the Franz von Liszt Institute for International Criminal Justice. She holds an LL.M. from Columbia Law School, New York, USA, and a Dr. iur. from Universität Hamburg, Germany. Her research focuses on international and comparative criminal law and legal theory.

Kalika Mehta is a Human Rights Lawyer and an Associate Researcher at the Franz von Liszt Institute for International Criminal Justice. She holds a Dr. iur. from Universität Hamburg, Germany, an LL.M. from the Geneva Academy of International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights, Geneva, Switzerland, and a B.A. LL.B (Hons.) from Rajiv Gandhi National University of Law, Punjab, India. Her research centers on theoretical critiques and practice of international criminal law and human rights.

Contributors

Karolina Aksamitowska Tallinn University, Tallinn, Estonia

Michelle Burgis-Kasthala University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK

Ishita Chakrabarty Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Geneva, Switzerland;
Quill Foundation, Delhi, India

Taxiarchis Fiskatoris Philipps-Universität Marburg, Marburg, Germany

Angie K. García Atehortúa Independent Lawyer, Bogotá, Colombia;
International Criminal Court, The Hague, The Netherlands

John-Mark Iyi African Centre for Transnational Criminal Justice, Faculty of Law,
University of the Western Cape, Bellville, Cape Town, South Africa

Guneet Kaur Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Berlin, Germany

Tonny Raymond Kirabira Law Department, University of Portsmouth,
Portsmouth, UK

Anastasiya Kotova Lund University, Lund, Sweden

Angela Mudukuti Harare, Zimbabwe

Fajri Matahati Muhammadin Department of International Law, Faculty of Law,
Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Ahmad Sadzali Department of Constitutional Law, Faculty of Law, Universitas
Islam Indonesia, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Nahed Samour Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Berlin, Germany

Christine Schwöbel-Patel Warwick Law School, Warwick, UK

Leigh Swigart International Center for Ethics, Justice and Public Life, Brandeis
University, Waltham, MA, USA

Valeria Vegh Weis Universität Konstanz Zukunfts Kolleg, Konstanz Universität,
Konstanz, Germany