

# **European Yearbook of Constitutional Law**

Volume 4

The *European Yearbook of Constitutional Law* (EYCL) is an annual publication devoted to the study of constitutional law. The yearbook provides a forum for in-depth analysis and discussion of new developments in constitutional law in Europe and beyond. Each issue is dedicated to a specific theme. Papers are subject to editorial and double-blind peer review. The yearbook is published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS in cooperation with Springer Publishers.

**Contact**

To get in touch, please send an e-mail to [eycl@tilburguniversity.edu](mailto:eycl@tilburguniversity.edu)

Jurgen de Poorter · Gerhard van der Schyff ·  
Maarten Stremmer · Maartje De Visser ·  
Ingrid Leijten · Charlotte van Oirsouw  
Editors

# European Yearbook of Constitutional Law 2022

A Constitutional Identity for the EU?



ASSER PRESS



Springer

*Editors*

Jurgen de Poorter  
Department of Public Law and Governance  
Tilburg Law School  
Tilburg, The Netherlands

Gerhard van der Schyff  
Department of Public Law and Governance  
Tilburg Law School  
Tilburg, The Netherlands

Maarten Stremmer  
Department of Public Law  
Faculty of Law  
Maastricht University  
Maastricht, The Netherlands

Maartje De Visser  
SMU School of Law  
Singapore, Singapore

Ingrid Leijten  
Department of Public Law and Governance  
Tilburg Law School  
Tilburg, The Netherlands

Charlotte van Oirsouw  
Department of Constitutional  
and Administrative Law  
Utrecht University  
Utrecht, The Netherlands

The views expressed in this Yearbook are not necessarily those of the members of the Editorial Board, the Board of Recommendation and/or those institutions they represent, including the T.M.C. Asser Instituut and T.M.C. ASSER PRESS.

ISSN 2405-6111 ISSN 2405-612X (electronic)  
European Yearbook of Constitutional Law  
ISBN 978-94-6265-594-2 ISBN 978-94-6265-595-9 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-595-9>

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands [www.asserpress.nl](http://www.asserpress.nl)  
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2023, corrected publication 2023

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE, part of Springer Nature  
The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

## **Editorial Board**

### *Series Editors*

Prof. Jurgen de Poorter (*Editor*), Tilburg University  
Dr. Gerhard van der Schyff (*Editor*), Tilburg University  
Dr. Maarten Stremmer (*Editor*), Maastricht University  
Dr. Maartje De Visser (*Editor*), Singapore Management University

## **Board of Recommendation**

Prof. Dr. Armin von Bogdandy, Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law  
and International Law  
Prof. em. Dr. Marc Bossuyt, University of Antwerp  
Prof. Dr. Alfonso Celotto, Roma Tre University  
Prof. Dr. Janneke Gerards, Utrecht University  
Prof. Dr. Daniel Halberstam, University of Michigan

# Preface

We are privileged to announce that Prof. Ingrid Leijten has joined the editorial board of the *European Yearbook of Constitutional Law*. She holds the chair of Dutch and European Constitutional Law at Tilburg Law School. Professor Leijten's academic insights and expertise will without a doubt be most valuable to the *Yearbook* as it grows from strength to strength.

In addition, we are happy to share with our readers that Charlotte van Oirsouw LL.M. has become one of the *Yearbook's* managing editors. She is currently working towards her Ph.D. at Utrecht Law School, having previously worked at Tilburg Law School.

Tilburg/Maastricht/Utrecht/Singapore  
The Netherlands/Singapore  
April 2023

The Editors

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction: Exploring the Concept of a Constitutional Identity for the European Union</b> .....	<b>1</b>
	Gerhard van der Schyff, Ingrid Leijten, Charlotte van Oirsouw, Jurgen de Poorter, Maarten Stremler and Maartje De Visser	
<b>2</b>	<b>Three Meanings of Constitutional Identity and Their Prospects in the European Union</b> .....	<b>13</b>
	Dieter Grimm	
<b>3</b>	<b>A Plaidoyer Against the Sisyphean Endeavour to Imagine the Constitutional Identity of the EU</b> .....	<b>25</b>
	Jakob Gašperin Wischhoff	
<b>4</b>	<b>The Constitutional Identity of the EU as a Counterbalance for Unconstitutional Constitutional Identities of the Member States</b> .....	<b>57</b>
	Tímea Drinóczi and Pietro Faraguna	
<b>5</b>	<b>Parameters of EU and Member State Constitutional Identity: A Topic in Development</b> .....	<b>89</b>
	Gerhard van der Schyff	
<b>6</b>	<b>St. Augustine and the Court of Justice of the European Union on Citizenship</b> .....	<b>111</b>
	Gohar Karapetian	
<b>7</b>	<b>The Principle of Solidarity Forging the Constitutional Identity of the European Union</b> .....	<b>133</b>
	Erika Arban	
<b>8</b>	<b>“United in Diversity”—Homogeneity and Differentiation as Parts of the Union’s Constitutional Identity</b> .....	<b>157</b>
	Robert Böttner	

**9 European Constitutional Identity as a Normative Concept:  
Pointing to the Core of European Democracies ..... 183**  
Giuliano Vosa

**10 From Monologues to Dialogue: The US “Certification”  
Procedure as a Source of Inspiration for EU Cooperative  
Judicial Federalism ..... 207**  
Alberto Nicòtina and Emil Martini

**Correction to: Introduction: Exploring the Concept  
of a Constitutional Identity for the European Union ..... C1**  
Gerhard van der Schyff, Ingrid Leijten, Charlotte van Oirsouw,  
Jurgen de Poorter, Maarten Stremler and Maartje De Visser



# Editors and Contributors

## About the Editors

**Jurgen de Poorter** is Professor of Administrative Law in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg University, The Netherlands. His research focuses in particular on constitutional dialogues, public interest litigation and methods of judicial lawmaking.

**Gerhard van der Schyff** is Associate Professor in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg University, The Netherlands. His research interests include constitutional law and fundamental rights, especially from a comparative and European perspective.

**Maarten Stremler** is Assistant Professor of Constitutional Law at the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University, The Netherlands. His research interests are comparative constitutional law and constitutional theory.

**Maartje De Visser** is Associate Professor at the Yong Pung How School of Law, Singapore. Her current research focuses on constitutional engagement by courts and non-judicial actors, transnational judicial dialogues in Europe and Asia, and means to improve constitutional literacy.

**Ingrid Leijten** is Professor of Dutch and European Constitutional Law in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg University, The Netherlands. Her research primarily deals with the changing role and meaning of fundamental rights against the background of broader (comparative) constitutional law developments.

**Charlotte van Oirsouw** is doctoral researcher at the Institute of Jurisprudence, Constitutional and Administrative Law at Utrecht University. Her research concerns the regulation of algorithmic decision-making by Dutch constitutional and administrative law. Her research combines legal doctrinal and empirical research approaches.

## Contributors

**Erika Arban** Melbourne Law School, Centre for Comparative Constitutional Studies, Melbourne, Australia

**Robert Böttner** University of Erfurt, Erfurt, Germany

**Tímea Drinóczi** Faculty of Law, Federal University of Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brazil

**Pietro Faraguna** Department of Constitutional Law, University of Trieste, Trieste, Italy

**Jakob Gašperin Wischhoff** DFG Graduate Program DynamInt, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Berlin, Germany

**Dieter Grimm** Humboldt University Berlin, Berlin, Germany;  
Wissenschaftskolleg zu Berlin, Institute for Advanced Study, Berlin, Germany

**Gohar Karapetian** Faculty of Law, University of Groningen, Groningen, The Netherlands

**Emil Martini** College of Europe, Bruges, Belgium

**Alberto Nicòtina** Government and Law Research Group, Faculty of Law, University of Antwerp, Antwerp, Belgium

**Giuliano Vosa** Department of Law, University of Catania, Catania, Italy