

Luca Pantaleo

Abuse of Law in the European Union

The Rise of a Special General Principle



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Luca Pantaleo
Department of Political and Social Sciences
University of Cagliari
Cagliari, Italy

ISBN 978-94-6265-730-4 ISBN 978-94-6265-731-1 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-731-1>

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2025

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE, part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

If disposing of this product, please recycle the paper.

Acknowledgements

In the acknowledgements to my first monograph, written more than six years ago, I noted how many people I was indebted to for its completion. The same holds true for this second monograph. Despite being more experienced (read: older) and, hopefully, a little wiser, writing a scholarly book remains a journey filled with its fair share of obstacles and challenges. My first thanks go, therefore, to all the friends and colleagues who, over these years, shared a smile, a kind word, or an encouraging message when I most needed it.

I began working on this book in the spring of 2021, that is, four years ago. It was a dark time, not just for me, but for much of the world. We were cautiously emerging from the Covid-19 pandemic and the unprecedented restrictions it brought, not long after we had all briefly feared that the extinction of the human race might not be such a far-fetched scenario after all. Curiously, this book owes its very inception to that moment in time. The idea was born in the midst of the first lockdown, in May 2020. I spent those days in my makeshift home office, alternating childcare shifts with my wife while trying to carry on with work. During one of the countless online meetings that defined that period, I was discussing possible monograph topics with my friend and colleague Amedeo Arena. Somewhere in that exchange, the idea for this book emerged—and stuck. I recently met Amedeo in Helsinki, where we served as judges at the Regional Final of the ELMC. He no longer remembers that conversation, but I remain sincerely grateful to him for sparking the inspiration, whether consciously or not.

I am also deeply indebted to Graham Butler. Graham co-authored an excellent book chapter on abuse of Union law, which is repeatedly cited throughout this book. It was published when I was about a year into this journey, at a time when I was far from convinced of my choice of topic and was even considering abandoning it altogether. Graham, who understood the potential of the topic far better than I did then, encouraged me to persevere and offered valuable guidance. Without his encouragement, this work might never have seen the light of day.

As always, my deepest thanks go to Paolo Palchetti. What I wrote in the first monograph still holds true, word for word. I am grateful to him for being both a lifelong academic mentor and a dear friend. Without his constant guidance, neither

this book nor indeed my academic path would have taken shape. I first met Paolo as a young law student in 2006, and ever since, through all that life has brought, he has always been there. I am especially thankful to him this time for hosting me as a visiting professor at the *Institut de recherche en droit international et européen de la Sorbonne* (IREDIES), Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne, in 2024. A considerable portion of this book was written in Paris, benefiting from the studious environment and the exceptional bibliographic resources of the city.

I also owe a special debt of gratitude to Enzo Cannizzaro, another guiding figure throughout my career. His thoughtful advice has always been available whenever I asked, and I am truly fortunate to have him as a mentor. If I were to offer one piece of advice to a young researcher embarking on an academic career, it would be this: seek out good mentors. I have been lucky enough to find two outstanding ones in Paolo and Enzo.

Many colleagues and friends have provided valuable input, whether by commenting on earlier drafts, discussing ideas during seminars, or simply over coffee or a beer. In alphabetical order, I thank: Adriana Brusca, Alina Carrozzini, Daniele Amoroso, Dilara Khamitova, Federica Velli, Felipe Tomazini, Francesca Ippolito, Francesco Seatzu, Giacomo Biagioni, James Harrison, Mads Andenas, Matthew Happold, Rachele Marconi and Tarjei Bekkedal. A heartfelt thanks also goes to the team at T.M.C. Asser Press, especially Frank Bakker and Kiki van Gurp, for their professionalism and support throughout this process.

Precious support was provided by Federico Casolari, who kindly agreed to review the manuscript and offered many valuable insights. One of these is expressly acknowledged in a footnote, though several others, no less important, remain unmentioned.

Last but never least, I am grateful to the members of my family, whose presence has sustained me throughout my life. To my grandfather, Antonio, whose memory and example continue to inspire me. To my parents, Fiore and Rosa, for always being there when I need them. To my brother, Maurizio, who brought joy into the final stages of writing this book by giving me a beautiful niece. And above all, to my wife Raquel, my partner in everything, and to my children, Eduardo and Giovanna, of whom I am proud every single day.

Cagliari, Italy
June 2025

Luca Pantaleo

Contents

1	At the Edge of the Law: Mapping the Terrain of Abuse in the EU Legal Order	1
1.1	The Aim of This Book and Delimitation	1
1.2	A Few Preliminary Issues	4
1.3	Plan of the Book	7
	References	8
2	Abuse of Law in Municipal Legal Orders and International Law: An Overview	9
2.1	Introduction	10
2.2	The Origins of the Concept of Abuse of Law from Roman Law to Modern Times	10
2.3	Abuse of Law in Domestic Legal Systems	12
2.3.1	Continental Europe	12
2.3.2	The Common Law Tradition	15
2.3.3	Japan, the Islamic Legal System and the Nordic Countries	16
2.4	The Concept of Abuse of Law in the International Legal Order	19
2.4.1	The Scholarly Dimension: A Theory of Abuse of Law in International Law	20
2.4.2	The Practice: Areas of International Law Where Abuse of Law Has Been Recognised	23
2.4.3	Abuse of Rights in the Field of Human Rights Law	26
2.4.4	An Appraisal of Abuse of Law in General International Law	27
2.5	Concluding Remarks	30
	References	31
3	Analysis of the Court of Justice's Case Law	35
3.1	Introduction	36
3.2	The First Phase	39
3.2.1	The Foundational Stone: <i>Van Binsbergen</i>	39

3.2.2	The <i>Knoors</i> Ruling, aka <i>Van Binsbergen</i> , the Sequel	41
3.2.3	The Emergence of a Different Form of Abuse in the EU Legal Order: Abuse of Process	42
3.2.4	The Improper Invocation of Rights Granted by Secondary Legislation: A Matter of Abuse or of the Scope of Application of EU Law? The Court's Answer in <i>Cremer</i> and <i>Töpfer</i>	45
3.2.5	The Emergence of <i>Fraus Legis</i> in the EU Legal Order: <i>Könecke</i> and the Use of Fraudulent Means to Exploit the Law	48
3.2.6	The Use and Abuse of the Free Movement of Goods to Circumvent National Legislation: The <i>Leclerc</i> Judgment	49
3.2.7	The Use of a Fundamental Freedom to Obtain a Benefit Granted by National Law: The <i>Segers</i> and <i>Lair</i> Rulings	50
3.2.8	The "Greek Challenge" Cases	54
3.2.9	Merging the Findings of <i>Van Binsbergen</i> and <i>Leclerc</i> : The <i>Veronica</i> Ruling	59
3.2.10	The Role of Harmonisation and Proportionality: The <i>Kraus</i> Judgment	60
3.2.11	The Prequel to <i>Emsland-Stärke</i> : <i>Boterlux</i>	61
3.2.12	How to Apply an Express Anti-abuse Clause and the Emergence of the Concept of "Valid Commercial Reasons": The <i>Leur-Bloem</i> Decision	64
3.2.13	When the Need to Combat Abuse Is Abused: The Misplaced Invocation of the Need to Prevent Tax Avoidance in <i>Imperial Chemical Industries</i>	65
3.2.14	An Internal Market Is an Internal Market: The Endorsement of Regulatory Arbitrage in <i>Centros</i>	67
3.3	The Second Phase	69
3.3.1	Developing a Test for Abuse: <i>Emsland-Stärke</i>	69
3.3.2	The Strengthening of the Court's Free Mover-Friendly Attitude in Relation to Persons: The Irrelevance of the Worker's Motives in <i>Akrich</i>	71
3.3.3	The Further Strengthening of the Court's Free Mover-Friendly Attitude in Relation to Persons: The Irrelevance of the Motives in <i>Chen</i>	74
3.3.4	Abuse of (Union) Law Meets Tax Evasion: The Court's Rulings in <i>Marks and Spencer</i> , <i>Halifax</i> , <i>Cadbury Schweppes</i> and <i>Kofoed</i>	76
3.3.5	More Cases of Tax Evasion and Abuse	85
3.3.6	Abuse of Law (or Lack Thereof) in the Field of Free Movement of Persons	90

3.3.7	Abuse of Union Law and the Recognition of Foreign Titles and Qualifications	95
3.3.8	Three Remaining Cases: <i>Slancheva</i> , <i>Kratzer</i> and <i>Polbud</i>	100
3.4	The Third Phase	103
3.4.1	Introduction	103
3.4.2	The Beginning of a New Era: The Landmark <i>Cussens</i> Ruling	104
3.4.3	The Differences Between Fraud and Abuse as They Emerged in the <i>Altun</i> Ruling	106
3.4.4	Setting the Boundaries of the General Principle of Prohibition of Abuse of Law: The Contribution of (a New Wave of) Tax Evasion Cases	108
3.4.5	The Application of the Principle of Abuse of Union Law in Horizontal Disputes	113
3.4.6	The Emergence of a New Trend? Recent Cases Concerning Abuse and Asylum	115
3.4.7	Going Back to the Origins: Abuse of Law and the Free Movement of Goods	117
3.4.8	Abuse of Union Law and the Insurance of Motor Vehicles: The <i>Matmut</i> Ruling	118
3.5	Conclusions (a Postponement)	120
	References	120
4	The Scope of Application of the Principle of Abuse of Law in the EU Legal Order	125
4.1	Introduction	125
4.2	Abuse of Law as a General Principle of EU Law	127
4.2.1	The Prohibition of Fraud as a General Principle of EU Law	131
4.3	Abuse of Union Law: A Typology	132
4.3.1	The Role of Proportionality	137
4.3.2	The Two Constitutive Elements of Abuse of Union Law: An Appraisal	139
4.4	The Application of Abuse of Law to Different Areas of EU Law	140
4.5	What Is the Role of Secondary Legislation?	143
4.6	Open Questions and Outstanding Challenges	146
4.7	Conclusions	149
	References	153
5	The Purpose and Function of Abuse of Law in the Union Legal Order	155
5.1	Introduction	155
5.2	The Purpose and Function of Abuse of Law in the Union Legal Order	156

5.3	The Purpose and Function of Abuse of Law in General: A Theory of Abuse of Law	161
5.4	Conclusions: Abuse of Union Law as an Integral Part of a Complete Legal System	165
	References	167
6	Concluding Reflections: Abuse of Law and the Maturation of the EU Legal Order	169
6.1	The Principle of Abuse of Law in the EU Legal Order: From the Uncertain First Steps of the Early Case Law to the Formulation of a Fully-Fledged Doctrine of Abuse	169
6.2	Abuse of EU Law: A Childhood Disease or an Inevitable Consequence of Maturity?	173
	References	175
	Index	177