

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	v
Acknowledgments	vii
Abbreviations	xix

PART I Introduction

Chapter 1	
MINORITY RIGHTS MECHANISMS, INSTRUMENTS AND BENEFICIARIES	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 Three Minority Rights Mechanisms – An Introduction to Part II	7
1.3 An Analysis of the Three Mechanisms through Case Studies – An Introduction to Part III	9
1.4 Minority Rights Instruments	10
1.4.1 A Short Historical Introduction	10
1.4.2 The Copenhagen Document	13
1.4.3 The Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities	16
1.4.4 The Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities	18
1.4.5 The Legal Status of the Minority Rights Instruments	20
1.5 The Beneficiaries of the Standards	27
1.6 Concluding Observations	32

PART II Analysis of Aims and Specific Working Methods

Chapter 2	
THE OSCE HIGH COMMISSIONER ON NATIONAL MINORITIES	37
2.1 Introduction	37
2.2 The Establishment of the High Commissioner	41
2.3 The Negotiations behind the Realisation of the Mandate	42
2.4 Objectives and Institutional Setting	45
2.5 Competences and Limitations	47

2.5.1	Early Warning	48
2.5.2	Early Action	50
2.5.3	Collecting and Receiving Information	51
2.5.4	Country Visits	52
2.5.5	Limitations	53
2.6	Key Characteristics	53
2.6.1	Independence and Impartiality	54
2.6.2	Confidentiality	55
2.6.3	Cooperative Attitude	58
2.7	Development of the Mandate and Working Methods	62
2.7.1	Assessment and Intensity of Involvement	65
2.7.2	Facilitating and Maintaining Dialogue	68
2.7.3	Country Recommendations	69
2.7.4	Country versus Thematic Approach	73
2.7.5	Political versus Legal Approach	76
2.7.6	Project Work	79
2.8	Deficiencies in the Mandate and Working Methods	81
2.8.1	Follow-Up	81
2.8.2	Participation of Minority Groups and NGOs in the Work of the HCNM	83
2.8.3	Individual Remedies	86
2.9	Other OSCE Activities in the Field of Minority Rights	86
2.9.1	Human Dimension Mechanisms	87
2.9.2	Long-Term Missions/ <i>Ad Hoc</i> Missions	88
2.10	Concluding Observations	91
 Chapter 3		
THE UN WORKING GROUP ON MINORITIES		95
3.1	The Establishment of the Working Group	95
3.2	Objectives and Institutional Setting	98
3.3	Competences and Limitations	100
3.4	Development of the Mandate and Working Methods	102
3.4.1	Facilitating and Maintaining Dialogue	102
3.4.2	Collecting and Receiving Information	104
3.4.3	Thematic Approach	105
3.4.4	Working Group Recommendations and Conclusions	107
3.4.5	Country Visits	109
3.4.6	Regional Approach	110
3.5	Deficiencies in the Mandate and Working Methods	112
3.5.1	Lack of Dialogue	112
3.5.2	Thematic Focus	115
3.5.3	Follow-Up	116
3.5.4	Global Focus	117
3.5.5	Individual Remedies	118

3.6	The Future Role of the Working Group	119
3.6.1	Special Advisor on Genocide	121
3.6.2	Independent Expert on Minority Issues	122
3.7	Other UN Activities in the Field of Minority Rights	127
3.7.1	The Human Rights Committee	127
3.7.1.1	Article 27 ICCPR	129
3.7.1.2	Cases relating to Minority Rights	131
3.7.2	Other UN Mechanisms Addressing Minority Rights	134
3.7.2.1	Treaty-Based Mechanisms	134
3.7.2.2	Charter-Based Mechanisms	138
3.8	Concluding Observations	140
Chapter 4		
THE COE ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON MINORITIES		145
4.1	Introduction	145
4.2	The Establishment of the Advisory Committee	146
4.2.1	The Work of CAHMIN	146
4.2.2	The Work of CAHMEC	148
4.3	Objectives and Institutional Setting	153
4.4	Competences and Limitations	154
4.4.1	Composition of the AC	154
4.4.2	AC Meetings	155
4.4.3	Reporting Procedure	156
4.4.4	The Right to Obtain Information and Hold Meetings	158
4.4.5	Follow-Up Procedure	160
4.5	Development of the Mandate and Working Methods	161
4.5.1	AC and CoM Meetings	161
4.5.2	Relation AC and CoM	163
4.5.3	State Reports	164
4.5.4	Collecting and Receiving Information	165
4.5.5	Country Visits	166
4.5.6	AC Opinions	168
4.5.6.1	General Remarks	168
4.5.6.2	Personal Scope of Application	169
4.5.6.3	Substantive Analysis	175
4.5.7	Country versus Thematic Approach	178
4.5.8	Facilitating and Maintaining Dialogue	179
4.5.9	Follow-Up	181
4.5.10	Participation of Minority Representatives and NGOs	182
4.5.11	Coordination and Cooperation	183
4.6	Deficiencies in the Mandate and Working Methods	183
4.6.1	Drawbacks of the Reporting System	183
4.6.2	Lack of Dialogue and Transparency	185
4.6.3	Too Broad an Approach?	186

4.6.4	Individual Remedies	189
4.7	Other CoE Activities in the Field of Minority Protection	190
4.7.1	Parliamentary Assembly	190
4.7.1.1	General Recommendations concerning Minority Issues	190
4.7.1.2	PA Recommendations concerning the FCNM	194
4.7.2	Monitoring the Honouring of CoE Obligations	195
4.7.3	European Commission against Racism and Intolerance	199
4.7.4	Venice Commission	200
4.7.5	Article 14 and the European Court of Human Rights	204
4.7.5.1	Article 14 ECHR	204
4.7.5.2	Other Cases relating to Minority Rights	207
4.7.5.3	References to the FCNM in the Court's Case-Law	211
4.7.6	Protocol 12 to the ECHR	213
4.7.7	Additional Protocol on the Rights of Minorities to the ECHR	214
4.7.8	European Charter for Regional and Minority Languages	217
4.8	Concluding Observations	218

Chapter 5

EVALUATING STRENGTHS, WEAKNESSES, AND OVERLAP 223

5.1	Introduction	223
5.2	Comparing Aims and Mandates	223
5.3	Comparative Analysis of Approaches and Working Methods	227
5.3.1	Country versus Thematic Approach	227
5.3.2	Non-Confrontational Approach	228
5.3.3	Promotion of Dialogue	229
5.3.4	Involvement of Civil Society	230
5.4	Increasing Correspondences and Existing Differences	231
5.5	Deficiencies in the Exercise of the Mandates	233
5.5.1	Dependence	233
5.5.2	Sufficient Follow-Up and Enforcement Measures	234
5.5.3	Lack of Individual Remedies	235
5.6	Conditions Affecting the Mechanisms' Ability to Influence Implementation	237
5.7	Concluding Observations	237

PART III

An Analysis of the Three Mechanisms through Case Studies

Introduction to Part III

CASE STUDIES ON MACEDONIA AND CROATIA	245
--	------------

Chapter 6	
THE INVOLVEMENT OF THE THREE MECHANISMS IN MACEDONIA	249
6.1 Historical Overview	249
6.1.1 1991-2001	249
6.1.2 Violent Conflict in 2001	252
6.1.3 The Ohrid Framework Agreement	253
6.2 The High Commissioner on National Minorities	256
6.2.1 Reasons for Involvement	256
6.2.2 The OSCE Mission and its Relation to the HCNM	257
6.3 The High Commissioner's Recommendations in 1993-2005	258
6.3.1 Education	258
6.3.2 Participation in Public Affairs	267
6.3.2.1 Local Self-Government	267
6.3.2.2 Employment in Public Services	270
6.3.2.3 Electoral Reforms	271
6.3.3 National Census of the Population	272
6.3.4 Strengthening Inter-Ethnic Dialogue	274
6.3.5 Strengthening the Rule of Law	275
6.3.6 Citizenship	277
6.3.7 Use of National Symbols	278
6.3.8 Access to the Media	280
6.4 Concluding Observations regarding the Implementation of the HCNM's Recommendations	281
6.5 The Working Group on Minorities	287
6.6 Interventions regarding Macedonia	288
6.7 Concluding Observations regarding the Involvement of the Working Group	289
6.8 Other UN Activities	290
6.8.1 UNPREDEP	290
6.8.2 Special Rapporteur on the Former Yugoslavia of the UN Commission on Human Rights	292
6.8.3 The Human Rights Committee	293
6.9 The Advisory Committee on Minorities	293
6.10 General Remarks regarding the First Monitoring Cycle	294
6.11 Article-by-Article Analysis	297
6.11.1 Personal Scope of Application	297
6.11.2 Right to be Treated (or not) as a Minority; Article 3	298
6.11.3 Right to Equality; Article 4	299
6.11.4 Maintenance and Development of Culture and Assimilation; Article 5	301
6.11.5 Promotion of Tolerance and Dialogue; Article 6	302
6.11.6 Freedom of Association and the Right to Establish Associations; Articles 7 and 8	302

6.11.7	Freedom of Expression and Access to the Media; Article 9	303
6.11.8	Right to Use the Minority Language and Names and Signs in the Minority Language; Articles 10 and 11	303
6.11.9	Instruction in and of the Mother Tongue; Articles 12, 13 and 14	304
6.11.10	Effective Representation at Local and National Level; Article 15	307
6.11.11	Measures that Alter the Proportions of the Population; Article 16	309
6.11.12	Cross-Border Contacts and Bilateral Agreements; Articles 17 and 18	309
6.12	Concluding Observations regarding the Implementation of the AC Opinion	309
6.13	Other CoE Activities	312
6.13.1	The Parliamentary Assembly	312
6.13.2	The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance	313
6.14	The European Union	316
6.14.1	The EU and the Protection of Minorities	316
6.14.2	The EU in Macedonia	321
6.14.3	The EU Special Representative	324
6.14.4	The European Commission	324
6.15	Coordination and Cooperation between the Institutions involved in Macedonia	326
6.16	Concluding Observations regarding the Implementation of Minority Rights in Macedonia	328
 Chapter 7		
THE INVOLVEMENT OF THE THREE MECHANISMS IN CROATIA		333
7.1	Historical Overview	333
7.2	The High Commissioner on National Minorities	335
7.2.1	Reasons for Involvement	335
7.2.2	The OSCE Mission and its Relation to the HCNM	336
7.3	The High Commissioner's Recommendations in 1995–2005	337
7.3.1	Return of Displaced Persons and Occupancy/Tenancy Rights	337
7.3.1.1	Occupancy Rights	339
7.3.1.2	Tenancy Rights	340
7.3.2	Constitutional Law on the Rights of National Minorities	346
7.3.2.1	Drafting Process	346
7.3.2.2	Substantive Provisions	350
7.3.3	Strengthening Inter-Ethnic Dialogue	351
7.4	Concluding Observations regarding the Implementation of the HCNM's Recommendations	352

7.5	The Working Group on Minorities	354
7.6	Other UN Activities	356
7.6.1	UNTAES	356
7.6.2	Special Rapporteur on the Former Yugoslavia of the UN Commission on Human Rights	357
7.6.3	The Human Rights Committee	359
7.7	The Advisory Committee on Minorities	359
7.8	General Remarks regarding the First and Second Monitoring Cycles	361
7.8.1	First Cycle	361
7.8.2	Second Cycle	362
7.9	Article-by-Article Analysis	364
7.9.1	Personal Scope of Application	364
7.9.2	Right to be Treated (or not) as a Minority; Article 3	365
7.9.3	Right to Equality; Article 4	367
7.9.4	Maintenance and Development of Culture and Assimilation; Article 5	369
7.9.5	Promotion of Tolerance and Dialogue; Article 6	369
7.9.6	Freedom of Association and the Right to Establish Associations; Articles 7 and 8	370
7.9.7	Freedom of Expression and Access to the Media; Article 9	371
7.9.8	Right to Use the Minority Language and Names and Signs in the Minority Language; Articles 10 and 11	372
7.9.9	Instruction in and of the Mother Tongue; Articles 12, 13 and 14	374
7.9.10	Effective Representation at Local and National Level; Article 15	376
7.9.11	Measures that Alter the Proportions of the Population; Article 16	379
7.9.12	Cross-Border Contacts and Bilateral Agreements; Articles 17 and 18	380
7.10	Concluding Observations regarding the Implementation of the AC Opinions	381
7.11	Other CoE Activities	383
7.11.1	The Venice Commission	384
7.11.2	The Parliamentary Assembly	384
7.11.3	The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance	386
7.12	The European Union	387
7.12.1	The European Commission	388
7.12.2	The European Parliament	389
7.13	Coordination and Cooperation between the Institutions involved in Croatia	390
7.14	Concluding Observations regarding the Implementation of Minority Rights in Croatia	392

Chapter 8	
CONDITIONS AND FACTORS INFLUENCING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MINORITY RIGHTS	395
8.1 Introduction	395
8.2 Evaluation of Conditions affecting the Mechanisms' Ability to Influence Implementation	396
8.2.1 Flexible Mandate	396
8.2.2 Independence	397
8.2.3 Possibility to Conduct Country Visits	400
8.2.4 Possibility to Continue Dialogue	401
8.2.5 Possibility to Seek Contacts with NGOs	402
8.2.6 Availability of Follow-Up Procedures	405
8.2.7 Availability of Enforcement Measures or Appropriate Incentives	407
8.2.8 Coordination and Cooperation Modalities	412
8.3 Evaluation of the Influence of Factors Specific to Minority Rights	416
8.3.1 Minority Rights Instruments	416
8.3.2 Beneficiaries of the Norms	421

PART IV
Concluding Observations

Chapter 9	
THE IMPACT OF MINORITY RIGHTS MECHANISMS	429
9.1 Introduction	429
9.2 Justifying the Existence of Three Minority Rights Mechanisms	430
9.3 Judicial and Non-Judicial Protection of Minority Rights	434
9.4 Assessing Conditions and Factors Influencing Implementation	438
9.5 Looking Ahead	445
Summary	451
Samenvatting	455
Bibliography	461
Table of treaties, documents and cases	483
Index	497