
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	v
Acknowledgements	vii
Abbreviations	xiii
Chapter 1 – Introduction	1
1.1 Command responsibility – a narrow and a broad concept	1
1.2 Terminology	3
1.3 The applicability of command responsibility in focus	5
1.4 Applicable law and sources	7
1.5 Scope and structure	8
Chapter 2 – The legal basis for command responsibility	11
2.1 Introduction	11
2.2 Codification by treaty	12
2.2.1 Emerging treaty provisions	12
2.2.2 Treaty definitions further developed	15
2.3 Customary status of command responsibility	18
2.3.1 Prior to the ICC	18
2.3.2 From ICC until the present	25
2.4 Present definitions by international courts and tribunals	28
2.4.1 Individual criminal responsibility	28
2.4.2 Command responsibility	30
2.4.2.1 <i>Actus reus</i>	32
2.4.2.2 <i>Mens rea</i>	34
2.5 Conclusion	37
Chapter 3 – Command responsibility in armed conflict	39
3.1 Introduction	39
3.2 The concept of command	40
3.2.1 Introduction	40
3.2.2 Definition of command	42
3.2.3 Levels and types of command	43
3.2.4 Commanders	44
3.2.5 Staff officers	45
3.2.6 The human factor in the command process	46
3.2.7 Command and management	49
3.3 The concept of responsibility	50
3.4 ‘General command responsibility’ as role responsibility	53
3.5 The moral component of command responsibility	57

3.6	The relationship between general command responsibility and command criminal responsibility	60
3.7	Conclusion	63
Chapter 4 – Applying command responsibility to civilian superiors		65
4.1	Introduction	65
4.2	The civilian superior	68
4.2.1	Identifying the civilian superior	68
4.2.2	Level of authority	71
4.2.3	Categories of civilians	74
4.2.3.1	Article 28(a) ICC – <i>de jure</i>	74
4.2.3.2	Article 28(a) ICC – <i>de facto</i>	76
4.2.3.3	Article 28(b) ICC	77
4.2.4	Civilian superiors identified	81
4.3	Civilian superiors as objects of the command responsibility principle in the judgements rendered by the <i>ad hoc</i> tribunals	88
4.3.1	Introduction	88
4.3.2	Convictions under Article 7(3)/6(3)	88
4.3.2.1	ICTY	88
4.3.2.2	ICTR	90
4.3.2.3	Discussion	99
4.3.3	Acquitted of Article 7(3)/6(3) charges	100
4.3.3.1	Vague indictments	100
4.3.3.2	Guilty pleas	104
4.3.3.3	Insufficient proof of the elements	106
4.3.3.3.1	Effective control	106
4.3.3.3.2	Knowledge	114
4.3.3.3.3	Necessary and reasonable measures	116
4.3.3.4	Unsuccessful ‘cumulative charges’	118
4.3.3.4.1	Article 7(1) and 7(3) = 7(1)	118
4.3.3.4.2	Article 7(1), so no Article 7(3)	120
4.3.3.4.3	Discussion	122
4.4	Conclusion	123
Chapter 5		
Remaining hurdles in the application of the command responsibility doctrine		125
5.1	Introduction	125
5.2	The nature of command responsibility	126
5.2.1	Liability for an international crime	126
5.2.2	An act <i>sui generis</i>	130
5.2.3	The bifurcated approach – Act <i>sui generis</i> and <i>sui generis</i> participation	136
5.3	Overlap between individual criminal responsibility and command responsibility?	139
5.3.1	Introduction	139

5.3.2	Joint Criminal Enterprise	140
5.3.2.1	JCE – The concept	140
5.3.2.2	JCE and command responsibility	142
5.3.3	Aiding and abetting	147
5.3.3.1	Aiding and abetting – The concept	147
5.3.3.2	Aiding and abetting and command responsibility	149
5.3.4	Cumulative conviction or aggravating circumstance	155
5.3.5	Conclusion	162
5.4	The nature of the crime underlying the charges of command responsibility	164
5.4.1	Introduction	165
5.4.2	Genocide	165
5.4.2.1	Applicability	165
5.4.2.2	Case law	169
5.4.2.3	Desirability	172
5.4.3	Aggression	175
5.4.4	Acts not qualifying as international crimes	176
5.5	Conclusion	180
Chapter 6		
Synthesis – justified differentiation between military and civilian superiors?		183
6.1	Introduction	183
6.2	Justified differentiation between military and civilian superiors?	183
6.2.1	The ICC provision and the <i>ad hoc</i> tribunal case law differentiation	183
6.2.2	The ‘traditional ambit’ of command responsibility	188
6.3	Where does this leave the civilian superior?	195
6.4	Future perspective on command responsibility	198
6.5	Final observations	204
Annex I		207
Annex II		213
Bibliography		219
Table of Treaties and Documents		225
Table of Cases		229
Index		240